

ADDENDUM

Part 1

AUGUST 23, 2021

AUGUST 23, 2021

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Is there apartment complex mixed in there somewhere I'm not seeing? Like here or here or I don't know.

You can see what the road patterns, what you got going on.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Can you blow up around East Lansing 24777 total population? Okay, no, I guess bring it down a little bit.

Yeah.

Right there to the left there is a little hook up there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: A little higher.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: There you go.

And when we run -- let's run this check on there and we will find out real quick so we don't, yeah, there is six of them so we need to start District two has a bunch of little pieces to it.

And it's actually the pieces, parts are floating around in District two.

For example and we probably should that is in District one.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is District two and not the one we are concerned about.

I will put it in four and this is a neat little tool here.

It's telling you where stuff is going.

You just keep going to the pieces, parts and I'll do a quick look.

That is pretty obviously District Four.

If you wait until the very end to do all this you could have hundreds and it will be one census block with 12000 people and it just messes you up.

So get this stuff cleaned up while you.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I wanted to acknowledge the comment made about school districts and that community of interest with the school districts I think we will get an overlay of the school districts and I know that that's going to help so I just wanted to acknowledge that I think you are absolutely right that we do want to draw these things with that in mind.

And it will be a lot simpler when we get that overlay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Everything is nice and clear clean now and a quick look at our numbers, and you see two is 6,000 under, 3 is 8,000 under so those blocks did have some population in them that we fixed, the districts we fixed.

Five is less than a percent off.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: I like it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You still have to go all the way around it.

So don't be surprised if that has to change and move because you're going to do districts all the way around it.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Are you satisfied, Richard?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes, I'm satisfied.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: You're talking the western part.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, I'm sorry the western part of Oakland county.

You have Holly.

Associated with that.

Scratch that instead of doing those two let's go into the western parts of Oakland County such as rose or Holly.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Am I in the right area here.

>> KIM BRACE: To the right, to the east.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: East, yeah, and to.

>> KIM BRACE: Into Oakland Township rose and Holly now I see them so you add those two six, is that the desire?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, then we can do the Flint areas when we get to them.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 18,000.

And 6 is still 13,000 light.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Okay what if we add Highland? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Then you will be about 6,000 over because that is 19,000 and you need 13,000.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Okay let's do it for now, it will be within the variables.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's 2.31%.

You are still getting a bunch of districts that are all high.

You know, they are over.

I just want to bring that to everybody's attention.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So what the reason I want to do this like I said was to get the Lansing area to be like one whole area made of two districts and not have parts of other counties in them.

And I also think it goes with the public comments that we've had.

The other comment I had was in the Ann Arbor, Monroe area but I feel if we get into that, it's going to mess up everything we have so we might not want to do that at this point.

What do y'all think?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I mean it's just another alternative why not take a look at it?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: It's on it.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Lett I'm the Chair you know I'm the one supposed to be calling on people.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Thank you Commissioner Szetela.

I see what you're doing.

Obviously.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Right it's high because and this is something we will have to decide as a Commission.

It's high because we are including Ypsilanti with Ann Arbor.

My idea would be to not include Ypsilanti with Ann Arbor.

We've got a lot of public comments saying that while they are in close proximity, they have different values.

I'll point specifically to public comment P2594 on the public comment tool.

Which says as much.

So what I would do is I would put Ypsilanti with the District we have drawn for Monroe right now, that purple one.

I'm not sure the District number.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is one, District one.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is going to move 76,000 people.

And I did not do that appropriately so I will do it again.

Got it right this time.

Now four is small and 8.7% and one corresponding is 28% high or 76,000 people.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I also included saline and York with four, those two.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: These two?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Those two.

And also that small little Township of Milan and I did not see that.

That presents some problems.

Let's put both halves with District Four.

It's interesting there are Townships that cross County boundaries.

>> KIM BRACE: That is common on that side and the election administrator the one up above is working the precincts up above but the County clerk below is doing those other precincts.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I like to point out there is one census block is in District one. Shall we put it in District Four?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Four is 2.1% high.

One is still 68,000 high.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Let's Zoom out to District one because now we have to take parts out of one to make it work.

So I would just have one be Monroe county plus the two that we added and then so, yeah, I would unassign which county was it? But unassign Lenawee County from the District.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The whole county.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Commissioner? Thank you.

So District three was short on people.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I do that too.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I never rarely do I argue with myself.

It does happen.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Kent I would like to go south and work north and let's try to grab, yes, along the border again.

And if we can let's keep the -- let's take portions of looks like, yeah, there is more of a City, right, in Monroe there so if we can take the whole City, looks like 53,000 short so we got 14, 20.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We have 46 coming.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: 46 coming, go ahead and assign that.

Okay so we are 11 short.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 11,000.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Raisinville and Exeter and London we will be pretty close there, yeah.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 12000.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: We will leave it at that and it's all because of population.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Next is Commissioner Szetela.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: All right, if you could just start where we are at. So we are now on what on District Four? And carry it up all the way to the county line.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: We will see what we come up with population wise. And that is the danger of starting in the middle and running to the water because District Four is seriously under populated.

District 4 needs 17,400 people.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So can you grab the Township above it new Boston and put that in? To the yep that one that is right above it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Sumpter, Huron, Rockwood, which one?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: It has new Boston and I think it's Huron I think the Township is Huron but it has new Boston in the center of it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That will put your District good within 456 people. Ideal.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay sounds good.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioner Szetela, can you provide any explanation about why you grouped this particular area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I was looking at the population.

And then on the border of Wayne County that is where you start to get into Down River. You have Gibraltar and Brownstown, Flat Rock. Those communities have identified as a community of interest or in our meetings. So I did not want to take from those communities because ideally, I want them to be grouped together, into a House District

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

rather than pulling one or two of those communities off. So Huron is similar to the county below it and New Boston is more rural and more park areas. So I thought it made sense to put them in with I think that is Ash Township underneath.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you.

Next is Commissioner Vallette.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE:

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Janice turn your mic on.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Somebody suggest someplace to start.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Down River.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Down River

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Flat Rock, Gibraltar, Brownstown, those are all right on that border there, just to the east of where I drew my line. Those are all considered Down River counties.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: That is Metro region rather than the southeast region.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Is this the area you were referencing.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: That is a different region.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You are not going in that region.

You are right Commissioner Rothorn then you got to go somewhere else.

You got to go up.

Back into Ann Arbor land.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Didn't we do the Ann Arbor area? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We are doing the house.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: This is the house so smaller districts.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We are looking at 91,000.

It's much smaller geographic area.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay thank you.

So we will do Augusta.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I think that's what it says.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, it does and this is York and this is Sumpter.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Then let's take Sumpter and York and Saline.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's approximately 28,128.

We still have 70,000 to go.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: The City of Saline and then Lodi.

And Van Buren and Belleville.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area here?

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: No, above Sumpter.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Above Sumpter, I'm sorry.

SEPTEMBER 7, 2021

SEPTEMBER 7, 2021

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I think we are good and I saw Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Just to add to that to it might help you Sarah. From a COI perspective one of the things we constantly heard was keep Midland Bay City Saginaw together. So I look at that as a COI either it may or may not be written in the tool. And we adhere to that by doing the District this way. The other comment I had was from the previous question, we originally started going down the coastline trying to keep the coastline intact. But what we saw was happening is we got too far into the thumb and the thumb is more or less a region of its own. And so we backed off of that. And took another approach. So those two comments to help you out.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Commissioner Orton then Eid then General Counsel?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Thank you Commissioner Rothorn. I know that the distinction again on the as far as the diverse population of the state is as distinct from communities of interest and those diverse populations self identifying or being identified again by the racial or census data or the ACS data and other data that the Commission has in front of them would again be separate and distinct from both the communities of interest as well as compliance with the Voting Rights Act. Again I know in Ann Arbor I mentioned that you may have minority communities whose numbers are not sufficient or who do not necessarily the numbers are not sufficient enough for a racial bloc voting analysis that was performed by Dr. Handley. But that they are present in that community and could be maintained under the third criteria.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Thank you General Counsel Commissioner Orton then Commissioner Eid.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So two things. The comment I was going to make just to support the use of communities of interest for the record is we have had a lot of comments about the sunrise coast which I assume is that right there that we did. Keeping that together. But what General Counsel just said brings up a good point that I thought this weekend as I was contemplating this I thought maybe we should have a discussion about or at least I just need clarification I guess in the third criteria when it says to reflect the diverse population it sound like General Counsel you're saying that that is racial. I wasn't thinking of diverse population as racial. I was thinking of it as farming and lakeshore and things like that.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

So what is it? Or do we decide?

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Certainly the Commission decides.

It can be racial.

Again, as long as race is not the predominant factor in redistricting.

Either under a voting rights analysis or a community of interest analysis.

It could be kind of by virtue of location as you were indicating, you know, center, state, farming community versus the shoreline community.

Not versus it's not the word that I meant to select.

As distinguished from ashore line community of interest.

So hopefully that's helpful.

It can be a minority community, again, I think there are some that Dr. Handley found that there were no Hispanic or Asian populations that were sufficient in number to under take a bloc racial bloc voting analysis so those communities as they are apparent in your data you can take that under consideration with all the other factors that you're taking into consideration.

Just not would be the primary driving factor.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: It's the speed limit but not the driver
Commissioner Lett and I did say Commissioner Eid first then Commissioner Lett unless you have a direct.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I would caution against confusing population with geography.

So if you're talking about urban to me that's geography.

You're talking about rural that's geography.

If you are talking about farmers, that's a population.

You are talking about City dwellers that is a population.

If you are talking about polish that is a population.

So diverse population is the people in the state, not to be confused with different geographical areas which obviously we are taking into consideration now when we are drawing the counties and using Townships, et cetera, those are all geographical if that is helpful.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Thank you.
Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So two things to clarify my understanding.
The first is I would like us to have a larger discussion on the first thing that General Counsel said about what communities of interest are and aren't as it pertains to counties versus townships.

Because I think she made a great point and please correct me I do not want to put words in your mouth but you know when people came to us and said yeah my specific Township has these values and are similar to this Township that could be a community of interest.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But I'm not sure if just saying my whole county is a community of interest, you know, meets the criteria that's been established.

So I think and I think it would be helpful if we had a discussion about that.

Because it's something that we keep coming back to over and over.

And the second thing is do we have to justify diversity when we are working in a part of the state that honestly doesn't have that much diversity? I think that is a little kind of an elephant in the room here.

You look at District 4 and look at most of northern Michigan I mean it's you can look out 3, 4 and 5 it's 91% white, 93% white and 88% white so there isn't much diversity up there unfortunately and I think that's just how it is.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I see Commissioner Lange and Chair Kellom.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Let's get back to the diversity.

We just heard that diversity is not necessarily race.

So to sit there and say there is not a diverse population within Northern Michigan I think some people may take that a little offensively.

Diversity can be so many different things.

It's not just -- based on race.

It was just said it can be a farm community, it can be diverse.

Our job is to define what is diverse but to say there is no diversity in the area because 96% is white that is a little shallow.

I think we need to voice things a little bit better.

And I'm not trying to start a thing.

But I think when we look -- diversity could be LGBTQ.

So I mean, I think we need to be a little more open minded when it comes to the category of diversity.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Commissioner Lett and Chair Kellom had her hand up first.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I won't be labor the point Commissioner Lange said what I was essentially going to say in line of the conversation of what defines diversity and will also respond to what was said earlier regarding a Township, not necessarily or a County not necessarily being a community of interest.

And I think what folks in the community are trying to say is that there is a concentration of a similar interest in which they live, which speaking to Commissioner Lange and I's point of diversity, that makes them develop a sense of community that they want to protect.

So I think it's our job because we can't expect the public to know the lingo to use.

They are never going to catch up, we can't catch up to some of the things we have to learn.

So it's our job to do the research to see why these groups of people are calling this Township or this County a community of interest.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

To that point, I would also caution us just because we hear the word urban and rural we also know that sometimes those labels can be context for other things.

So I just think that we have to think critically about some of these labels.

But not over do the conversation to the point where we are scared to make justifications and to that point I just wanted a clarification to make sure I'm tracking.

I believe that Sarah Reinhardt asked Commissioner Weiss a question regarding diverse populations in this District and I'm just trying to track how we have got to a discussion of our individual definitions of diversity just in the essence of time just to make sure I have an understanding of what this conversation is.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Madam Chair person would it be helpful if I repeated the question?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes I thought the question was directed to either one or two people not to say everyone can't answer just asking.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Sure, the question was: How did you consider reflection of the state's diverse populations, how did you take that into account when drawing this District?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay yes I understood correctly.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Commissioner Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I don't disagree that there are more than what's listed on this matrix of white, Black, Asian, Hispanic and minority.

But I will go to our map drawers and say how can we drill down to see what's other, quote, communities of interest are out there that are not listed on this matrix.

>> I believe the information you are looking for is in the ACS American community survey so this may be a point you have heard but let me repeat this.

Originally the census had a long form and a short form so you actually had to answer all these questions if you were the one out of one hundred people or I don't remember I think it was one out of a hundred they had to answer all the long form questions which included information about ethnicity.

You know, do you have German heritage, do you have in the case of western Michigan we've heard a lot of discussion or a little bit about Dutch heritage being significant in western Michigan.

That is contained in the American community survey.

The change was the census decided to get that information using a sample survey where they use survey data you know, statistics to capture the same kind of information about the population.

So the ACS data can provide the ethnicity information and that is contained in this ACS data.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Do we have access to that? .

>> MR. MORGAN: My understanding is we do have access to that.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: So the question becomes how are we going to use it?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Well, I made the change because we had a District already there and it was under populated.

And the next District or next I'm sorry, next Township that was further south filled that void and kept us well almost perfect as far as numbers go.

So it was most logical thing to do.

And then it also supported the COI that we have heard.

All the public comments we have heard about having the lakeshore represented.

And this was one or this was an opportunity to have that done in the Senate.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: And the final question how did you take into account reflection of the state's diverse populations?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Well to me the diverse population was the lakeshore people and the values that the people living along the lake have compared to those living inland.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Sorry I mean within the District.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Oh, within this District?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Boy, I could need a little help on this.

I mean basically what we were doing is focusing in on the people living along the lake and their economic concerns on the lakeshore, on the lakeshore community.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I see Commissioner Lange nodding her head.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I will help you out a little Doug as far as diversity you have a wide range of people with different economics.

You have orchard farmers.

You have your industrial areas Mason County also.

You have your lakeshore areas, Muskegon County has their population, their African/American population living within it.

I think there is a broad base of diversity within those counties.

Manistee I'm not 100% positive but I think you might also have some Native American there is a reservation but there is a Native American tribal community within Manistee County also.

So I think you kind of got the diversity covered from economics to ethnicity covered.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Thank you Rhonda.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Okay, so after Commissioner Clark we have Commissioner Eid I believe.

Is that true? Curry.

I apologize.

Yes, Commissioner Curry are you with us? Okay Mr. Morgan?

>> MR. MORGAN: So earlier I showed or talked about the idea of showing layers from previous regions that you've already done some work in.

SEPTEMBER 8, 2021

SEPTEMBER 8, 2021

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Yes, Delta Township.

>> MR. MORGAN: Put that into this District?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Well can you pull that up so we can know what the distribution of population is? Demographics.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, so let's do this, the quick way I'm going to do this is I'm just going to create a new District with just Delta Township.

And then you will see the results in that.

And then I will undo that.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Madam Chair.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes, General Counsel.

>> MS. JULIANNE PASTULA: Thank you so much while Mr. Morgan is facilitating Commissioner Lett's request, I wanted to address that the packing and cracking terms while I know we are using them casually in this context they have significant meaning particularly to Voting Rights Act compliance.

And I just would like to highlight for the benefit of the public that based on the racial bloc voting analysis done by the Commission's consultant expert, that they were not sufficient numbers of minorities in the community that the Commission is currently discussing.

So that the Voting Rights Act would not be implicated in this area.

However, under the third criteria which I believe is what Commissioner Rothhorn was focusing on as far as communities of interest and that the maps shall reflect the state's diverse population, what I understand to be happening is that a conscious choice to not split the concentrated minority communities would be undertaken in consideration with a variety of other factors.

However, that it's more trying to respect the diverse population of that area and keep it intact.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Thank you General Counsel.

Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: When I look at the numbers of what Steve did and then what we just did and including Delta, those percentages are basically the same. I mean, non-Hispanic white is basically two thirds and your minority is basically one-third.

Either way you do it.

I prefer and I know you don't like the shape but I prefer what Steve has done.

But I'm not an expert on Lansing area.

And I think I would defer to you and Steve.

>> MR. MORGAN: And also just to clarify for the moment I'm just putting Delta in its own District so you can display the demographic information easily.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So what number is that? I can't tell.

>> MR. MORGAN: It says 30 so this is just Delta Township.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: John could you overlay the blue overlay that you displayed earlier?

>> MR. MORGAN: Sure.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So I mean I just got to say I like this blue overlay quite a bit. Respectfully, in my opinion, I think that this would be the better way to go. It keeps Delta Township with most of the Lansing Area. And it puts East Lansing up with Clinton and Shiawassee. Clinton and Shiawassee are currently in a Senate District. And I don't understand why we are splitting up Delta from the rest of Lansing when we know we have to split up the Lansing area just because there is too many people.

It's just a question of where.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Well it's currently split.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I disagree.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: The argument is the same, Anthony.

You're saying that Shiawassee and Clinton are together along with Eaton County now in the Senate District which is correct and Delta is split off from Ingham County. Everything I heard about Shiawassee is they didn't want to be in that same District again.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So what is important about keeping that separate in your mind, Steve? Is it just you want to keep the County of Shiawassee separate? I'm trying to understand what the resistance is of moving the minority communities together.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I don't have a problem moving the minority communities together period.

I don't have a problem with that.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I'm trying to understand.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: You asked me a question I don't have a problem with that Shiawassee County has repeatedly stated they don't want to be with Ingham, Eaton and Clinton County and said they want to be their own entity as a whole County.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Uh-huh.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: If we want to add voting blocs off of Delta County into Lansing, that can be done because all of the concentration is right along Waverly road. It's not very deep.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Right.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Into Eaton County.

So the idea is to bring them in to Lansing we can do it that way.

And I will say that looking at the population demographics it's not going to make any difference.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: We had that from every County.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Highland is in Oakland County and so is Holly.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: And Rose Township.

Those are all Oakland County.

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Commissioner Rothhorn?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Janice do you think it's a good idea to take north of M59 does that seem like a logical divider or is that something, yeah.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yeah, it probably is.

Yeah, I think when we talk, we do say north and south of M59 Highland road.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: The only problem with that is the precincts don't go north and south of M59.

We can go to the blocks, but I hate to do that.

Let's at least take the top precincts of Highland Township, John, and put those back in.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I agree the precincts don't line up but that doesn't mean the county Clark can't change the precincts once we reset the District lines and that is one of their jobs that they are going to have to assess.

Yeah, all the county clerks.

They realize this, yeah.

>> MR. MORGAN: This follows the precinct boundaries and the population deviation.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So where is the population there that made it over?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: It's under.

>> MR. MORGAN: So I just added in a little bit.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: It seems like it was over and why we took that out.

>> MR. MORGAN: This area here is highly populated and this precinct this one will go down here south of M59 and this one here and this one here.

These are the ones that originally you took and said you didn't want to split the lakes.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Uh-huh.

Well, I feel like we should considering what Janice said, this whole Highland Township should be with Milford.

We need to find a different Township.

>> MR. MORGAN: You want me to undo this then and look for another Township?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You want to undo what he took off or the whole Township?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: The whole Township.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You want to take off the whole Township and fine another Township to add on, right?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. MORGAN: Right, that is what I'm doing.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I thought this would be an easy, quick one.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I mean it could be an easy one.

We are still within the allowable population deviation.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Right.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Just depends how close we want to get to because with all of Highland off the rest of it is still you know it's not perfect.

And I would like to see it closer to zero, but you know I don't know how it's going to affect things down the line.

It might be better to reassess the specific boundaries as far as population goes after we have a full map.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: We should have conversation about that.

Do we want to get as close as possible as we go? Or do we want to do the fine tuning later?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Rothhorn?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: My own intuition is respect the COIs and the boundary I say the people have given us as best as we can.

Of course we are looking at population but if we have that aggregate and if we see that we are over in some districts and under in others and getting close to 0 and keeping aggregate in mind that feels like the right way to go if we are over, under that is okay but as long as we use COIs contiguity and voting population and respecting the Federal laws.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, so thank you John.

Can you just slowly, yeah, go around all the Townships around that District and let me look?

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay, so up here, again, in Genesee, you've got Gaines, Mundy and Grand Blanc. And you got...that is right on the border of Flint.

Then you have over here in Oakland Township, Groveland, 6,000. Springfield 14.

We talked about Highland.

Milford down here is 17.

And then Lyon and South Lyon combined are quite a bit.

South Lyon by itself is 11,700.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I think they associate with Novi.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay and then let's see now in Washtenaw you have the top tier of Townships here Northfield, Webster, Dexter, and Lyndon.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay go to the, yeah, west.

>> MR. MORGAN: Stockbridge, white oak and then while we've accounted for these other Townships here in Ingham around Williamston, that District was overpopulated.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Well, scroll down just a tiny bit.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Wayne County is sort of Down River and Monroe County is considered separate.

But you know I'm sure we received other comments saying they are.

It's just sort of a one of those areas where we are going to have conflicting sort of conflicting reports on whether Monroe is Down River or not Down River but there is a lot of population in those areas particularly as you go up the coast so I just hope we don't get too trapped but then again like I said before these are always temporary maps and can move some lines if we need to.

Commissioner Eid and then Commissioner Lett.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yeah, I got to agree with what Commissioner Szetela just said.

I mean you know maybe some of that area could be considered down river like maybe part of Berlin, maybe part of Ash but the rest of it is no down river in the same way you know Allen Park and those areas are you know and Romulus, browns town and wood haven and this is an area we will have to pay particular attention to when it comes to communities of interest in the area because all we have been hearing for months and months and months is the racial makeup of these down river communities are different. And it's something we really have to look out for.

Because there are not you know there are not many Arab Americans in southern Monroe County.

There aren't many Hispanic or Bengali people in that part.

So I would be weary of just calling it all Down River.

Certainly some of it can be Down River but it's going to be hard to meld it.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Couldn't we also say that lake Erie coast is going to have more in common with Downriver areas kind of maybe?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes and no.

So when you get down to Monroe it was traditionally more farming mixed with some automotive.

When you get into like I don't know the environmental issues are very different is what I would say.

As you are in southwest Detroit and into the northern part of Downriver, they have significant environmental concerns there due to the industry that are quite different from Gradiel and Trenton. Even though they are all on the coast, it's different, different concerns, different areas.

And then again once you get to Monroe, Monroe has more industry particularly on the water.

So it's kind of an interesting mix in those areas.

So Commissioner Lett?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Yeah, I guess my question is why are we not including Berlin down through Eerie and including farmland on the west side of all of these counties? That doesn't make any sense to me.

And it looks like when you just look at it that you're setting yourself up for a gerrymandered District.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I can respond to that.
It's because we got this I-75 manufacturing community corridor and we got the 23 corridor which is more rural community.

That was essentially shared with us.

I think we are just trying to respond to a public comments.

But, yeah, it's a draft and it will change.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yep.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Madam Chairperson?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: If we leave it as is and then later come back and incorporate that corridor in this, that significantly changes what we did out west because of the high population in Monroe area.

And that may dictate a whole redo with the redistricting on the west side.

So I think it's something that we should consider now whether this is the right approach or whether we should incorporate it into Erin's District.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Mr. Morgan did you have a comment?

>> MR. MORGAN: I was going to say if you pause at this District and go back to Grand Rapids you could fill in a portion of that and then you would come down towards the border with Indiana and then you would see just where things align and where they don't.

And to that point you know you can hold this District as is.

As a draft.

And then when you come from Grand Rapids and the west along the Indiana border you will see where it meshes and where it doesn't.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: That presents us from backing ourselves in a corner and think it's a good suggestion.

>> MR. MORGAN: One way or the other you will have to resolve it but that is probably in a way that will help you visualize the areas that overlap easily.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: We may not have a choice of including the Monroe corridor.

>> MR. MORGAN: If it does not move on the population as it's drawn you will have to move the population through the Lansing area you have already drawn or along the southern border with Hillsdale and that area.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I think it's a good recommendation.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: All right any additional comments? So are we moving on to the next person? Commissioner Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Okay, so I think what I'm going to do at this particular point...

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I do have just one comment on number 27.

It works and it works well numbers wise.

I think it works well for communities of interest as well.

But you know the one thing that I'm having trouble with is you know we are making a very what I believe to be polarized districts.

I think if we were to run the numbers which we will at a later point, I mean this District would probably be 70 to 80% you know one way voting just because of that's you know we are putting all the City folk together in Ann Arbor with Ypsilanti.

So just thinking it's something we should be aware of.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Thank you Commissioner Eid.

I do think that's going to be a challenge as we move into particularly Wayne County. Because the reality is, is we do have these democratic pockets that are very strongly democratic.

But we also have republican pockets that are very strongly republican throughout the state.

And I would just state that you know again these maps are not final.

We are going to adjust lines and do partisan analysis and if need be, we can sort of Jimmy and move the lines around a bit to achieve partisan balance if we found out our maps are not passing those partisan measures of partisan fairness as it comes down. I mean I don't think we are unaware of it.

It's just I think we are focused on getting some lines down at this point and with the knowledge that we will be adjusting as time goes on.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: All right, well I think at this particular point in time I am going to fill in the remaining border counties.

So the red District that is drawn right there, let's fill that in.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Can we also see the overlay for the Western District that we did as well? Because I know we have one that may conflict with some of these lines.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We have three different ones.

We can take a moment and figure out what matters.

There is one in blue.

I think at this point can we turn the red off? Okay it looks to me like it just goes west.

I want to temporarily turn it off so we can see the other options that have been drawn.

There is one called from August 30th.

These two are from the west.

SEPTEMBER 9, 2021

SEPTEMBER 9, 2021

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Just give me the color.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 21 where my cursor is that is just a partial District.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I was actually going to go over to Detroit honestly because I feel like that's where we have the expert who is here to assist us and I would like him to assist us in these areas.

Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, could I make a suggestion before you start?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Sure.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: That one area in Monroe County that would be east of I-75 why don't we just make that a dumb any District so that we don't move because it's a controversial point at this time.

So we don't map anything into it and then discuss it afterwards.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I don't need to go anywhere down there to make a Senate District so I'm not worried about it at all.

Like that's not even a glimmer in my eye.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Sounds good.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: There is so much other population in the Detroit area I don't need to think about Monroe right now.

I'm going to take my mask off so people can hear me better.

So let's Zoom in to Detroit area a little bit or Wayne County specifically.

And I just want to look at something I did.

So just to start, I want you to go to I think it would be the Township level.

And I want you to select Dearborn, Dearborn Heights, Taylor and put them into one District.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: What was the third one?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Taylor which is just south of there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And we will start with District number shall we start with one in this area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, I think that probably makes sense.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And go up because everything else is the high end numbers.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Lett?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Why are we now changing numbering systems from what we have been doing? We got in a whole lot of trouble the last time we did that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The only districts that are numbered are the ones that have been completed.

When we started out, there was districts 1-8.

Well they have been renumbered 38 down through 35.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I just thought starting at one in this area would keep it from intruding on 20 and 21 and those areas that have yet to be assigned.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: My suggestion is we keep numbering the way we have been doing in whatever comes up it's what would we be up to 19.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 21 is partially done.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: 20.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 20 has already been done so it would be 19.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: 19.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: When you go to do the other districts the numbers will be out of sequence.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Clark then Commissioner Rothhorn please.
Thank you, Kent.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: This is to Rebecca is your objective in District to get the Arab American population in the one Senate District?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Somewhat yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Thank you.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: How far under I'm sorry MC did you have a comment I did not mean to talk over you.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: It was only that Commissioner Lett because I think the one is appropriate because we are trying to reference the old maps and in the Detroit area is where the 1234 so it's just looking at the way that we try to get well actually we can have it renumbered I withdraw.
Never mind never mind sed Szetela I don't have a preference one way or another. I don't really care, whatever works and whatever you think makes the most sense Kent I don't care.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's absolutely up to the Commissioners.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: If we went with, I think you said 19 is next we just have to renumber them at the end, right?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I like the renumbering at the end.
It just makes more sense and we can keep going with 19.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So let's just keep it 19.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Vice Chair Szetela you are under looks like 28,516.
He just renumbered it to 19 so sorry.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: That is okay no worries I want to go up into Redford.
Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Continue Redford.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yep.
Up to five mile.
We can't take all of Redford.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

It's too big.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The northern part?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, we don't want to go all the way up to 8 mile we just want to go to a five mile and that should get us pretty close.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Unassign what area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Can I walk over and show you.

It might be easier.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You are welcome to it.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So if you follow this down and come across that is five mile so take off that part.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: This little Divot out that is park land.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Got it.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: And what is that population wise? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: .02%.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I'm going to leave that.

So for Commissioner or for Sarah for Department of State, my thought process on this District is I am trying to create and preserve the communities of interest that are Arab Americans that are located in Dearborn, Dearborn Heights and Southern Redford Township and trying to put them all in one District.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So I think, I think this is great but I think we can make it a little better by making some small changes.

I don't know if taking full Townships I think we are going to have to Zoom in and look at it at a deeper level than Townships to really get this area right.

For example part of Inkster Township to the east of Inkster road if we Zoom in on that that could get us a lot of population and there are a lot of people of Middle Eastern dissent and if we Zoom in to that road.

It's weird the black line that the District currently splits if we take that line down through Inkster road and get that part of Inkster Township in with this District.

I think that would be a little better.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Vice Chair Szetela please thank you Commissioner Eid.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Having grown up in the area and the and moss tear between Inkster and Dearborn I would be uncomfortable lumping Inkster in with Dearborn.

There is a long history of animosity between those two communities.

Inkster is primarily African/American.

And there is a long history of parks policy from Dearborn about keeping

African/Americans out of their parks with ID and residency requirements and I just think

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

ignoring that history and putting those groups together is diluting that African/American vote there.

And frankly in a way that is painful for the people who are in Inkster so I just don't think that is a great idea.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: This is Commissioner Kellom I would just echo really quickly that the racial tension between adding Inkster into that area so that is something to be mindful of.

Did I see Commissioner Rothhorn's hand?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: No.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, what I'd like to point out we had some comment that the Arab American communities is more densely populated to the west of Southfield freeway in the Dearborn area.

And so I think that overflow and that overflow into this area that Anthony suggested from Dearborn might be appropriate.

But I have no idea on the tensions between the two communities.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Vice Chair.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Please.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah so, the concentrations of Arabs in Dearborn historically was on the eastern side.
Bordering Detroit.
East Dearborn.

And certain neighborhoods within Detroit as well where there are high Arab American populations as well.

The side you're talking about is west Dearborn and then is boarded by Dearborn Heights so that little strip that comes down is actually Dearborn heights so that is not Dearborn at all that you are seeing and that is far removed from Southfield freeway.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Thank you.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you Commissioner Clark, thank you Commissioner Szetela.

Commissioner Eid, please.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: And I'd also suggest you know instead of having Taylor along with this District moving I agree with what you just said about the population being more east bound but I think it goes more further than what we have now as far as the eastbound border being in Dearborn.

I think we can go into west Detroit here and maybe take out some of Taylor, take out some of Redford Township, which is completely different.

And I think you know while doing this, Mr. Adelson pointed this out, but we've had some very good communities of interest maps that include West Detroit, along with this District that you're trying to draw.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

It is ID number W1530 by Mariam Oknon. She has a couple really good comments actually that I suggest everyone read.

She is one of the community organizers with Access Clinic.

And, you know, they work with this population every single day.

She submitted a map.

Along with a very powerful letter titled a letter from an Arab American. And also maps for the access and ATIA communities in Hamtramck and Detroit. And the ones for the Dearborn/Detroit area go further in West Detroit than what we have here and do not include Redford or Taylor.

So I think we should at least examine if we can do something like that.

I'm not sure if the population matches up with taking out those cities.

But I think it's something we should examine.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I would be okay with moving somewhat into Detroit. And pulling out Taylor.

But that's going to be a precinct by precinct draw because you're not going to be able to just take whole areas.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Rothhorn, please.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I was just thinking if we could get so because we are working with Arab Americans and because we are working with census data can we get population, is there some way to tease this out Mr. Adelson and get numbers of what we think we are doing on the map?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Yeah, I think that is a great point. As you know and I think Mr. Brace talked about this at the beginning the census does not have a tab or unique description for people of Middle Eastern or Arab descent. So he had suggested, and I concur, looking at additional sources of information like the American community survey, that does breakout that population by race. And that's not the current 2020 census data. But this is an example of a population that is covered by the Voting Rights Act. That is not defined as a specific race in the census data where they have been specific public comments referencing this community. That is important as you all were doing to look at it and make the considerations that you are.

But getting data and information beyond the 2020 census data.

Because that just will not separate out Arab Americans or people of Middle Eastern ancestry.

Does that make sense?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I'm hearing you say we need to use the COI data if we try to draw and reference it and we can't excuse me the American community survey but that is our homework and we would have to bring that in as homework.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Right across there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Is this the correct area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Take this area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes, so that is Warren avenue right along there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I will have to do an undo.

I did the whole Township Szetela se you will have to do blocks.

So add that in.

So what does that bring my population to? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's 14,000 short.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Now I want you to take it up to Tireman which is the next major road that goes across there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This here.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Tire man.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I see it now, this right here.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Grab Tireman.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Those are precincts should I go back and do blocks?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: What is the population selected.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That area is 10,585 people.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So select that then go over a little to the east and grab the rest of it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This precinct here has 2287.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: 2287 so add that one in.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You're now .71% low.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay so we can leave it there or we can try to grab you know change it around and do a little on the east side as well but I think that's a good area.

That is the Warren avenue strip, which is a lot of Arab American restaurants, a lot of Arab American businesses, a high population but it doesn't quite get into the areas that have been identified for us that the Rosedale Park area that wants to stay together so we are not quite getting into that yet and I don't think we would want to do that so.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Eid and then Commissioner Clark.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So I really like those changes.

I might suggest going to joy road if you want and going over.

But I still I think what we have there for that whole area of Dearborn, Dearborn Heights up to the road you drew is fine.

But I still think rather than Taylor being included in this District there are more Middle Eastern people in the City of Melvindale and then the northern part of Allen Park and also in the northwestern part of Lincoln Park, west of I-75.

I think that would be better serving the community rather than Taylor.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

And I also think again we can go a little bit east of the City line of Dearborn as well.
And still be okay.

There are a lot of Middle Easterners in western Detroit as well.

I mean there is historic mosques over there as well as, you know, various Islamic associations. And this is all in that geography in what Mr. Adelson was talking about. I will name it again, W1530. And it has all of the community centers in the area and includes the City of Melvindale.

It includes that northern part of Allen Park and it does not include any of Taylor.
So you would be willing to do that, I think we will have a really good District here.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So my concern with that is Melvindale and Allen Park wanted to be in Down River and they were very clear about that.
We received multiple public comments about that.

The same thing with Lincoln Park and Delray neighborhood in Detroit when we start pulling into that, we had multiple public comments about the Latino community and those neighborhoods wanting to be together as well as the environmental concerns with River Rouge, Lincoln Park and Delray. If we start pulling that into Dearborn, you are diluting those concerns because the people in Dearborn and Dearborn Heights just simply don't have those concerns at all. Neither does Taylor, which is why I was trying to stay out of that area.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I agree that is a concern. But you could still make a Down River district out of Delray, River Rouge, Ecorse and the rest of Lincoln Park and the rest of Allen Park and Wyandotte as well.
Those are all still Down River communities even though they don't -- we would be not including Melvindale as part of that, but all the rest of them could still make a Down River community.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You are talking including Southwest Detroit, which in my town halls with people in Down River, they did not want to be included in Southwest Detroit.

They were very clear about that.

So I think we've got a lot to balance here.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Mr. Adelson had his hand raised, then Commissioner Orton, please.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Thank you.
I just wanted to make a couple of points.

While they don't necessarily or they may not necessarily apply here I wanted to remind the Commission that it is legally acceptable according to the support court to under populate up to a certain point, certain districts if Voting Rights Act compliance is at issue.

I'm not suggesting that is true here.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But just keep that in mind as one of the things that we did in Arizona was there was significant racially polarized voting in our analysis and there was less white press voter than there is here.

So that is an issue.

The -- you can under populate a District if necessary to comply with the Voting Rights Act.

And I want to follow-up on briefly Commissioner Szetela's point about the balancing.

And yes, that can get complicated.

And particularly when you're dealing with people who may or may not coalesce from a voting point standpoint but that is at the heart when you get in an urban center often what you have to do.

But I particularly wanted to mention the under populating issue thank you.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Thank you.

And Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So I have two things first of all, I think it bears reminding us all that town halls are purely for information.

We cannot consider information that was got, that was received at town halls because it was not one of our open meetings.

And also, we have received many, many Arab American community maps on our portal. I think it would be wise to look at that and compare with what we're drawing before we say that we are final, final draft.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I respect those opinions.

I will also say even though I'm a native Detroit I'm familiar with this area.

And if you cut too far into Melvindale and Allen Park the unique thing of Detroit the neighborhoods change drastically like immediately so your neighbor or your community center here where in the suburbs or other areas, we have worked with they kind of bleed in seamlessly.

It's a direct difference of culture so I would caution even having family that grows up in the Down River area it's a very tight and sincere community so it's not just a line we are simply looking at.

Those are my tidbits.

Commissioner Clark? I'm so sorry your hand is hidden behind the screen directly in front of my face so you have to give me an elementary school.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: From what I know of the area, what you just did Rebecca on the northern part of this is really appropriate.

I'm not familiar with the south side.

I'd have to depend on you and Brittini and Anthony to direct us there.

But the one comment I wanted to make.

When we went north, we started eating into the City of Detroit.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioner Clark?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: My thoughts when we do that is that we keep the individual communities in Detroit together because that seemed to be a big focus when we talked to the people in Detroit.

And I think we got a map the other day showing where those what those were.

So I wouldn't want to start splitting up those communities because that appeared to me and Brittini could help me with this to be a very sensitive and a very common comment that we got from the individual communities in the Detroit area.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Clark say that last part again I'm sorry I didn't hear you.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I thought that the comments that I heard when we had the two public hearings in Detroit where people always talked about their communities you know and how Detroit is split up into maybe 20 different communities. I would not want to see those split up when we do the districts. I'd want to keep those whole.

And that maybe a difficult thing to do.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yeah, that is why I just said it's food for thought. Like Wyandotte South Gate Allen Park and Melvindale and river Rouge there is a Down River pride there.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Just a quick reminder for Commissioners as you are speaking make sure you are speaking directly into the microphone. I know it's uncomfortable when you are talking to someone seated behind you but in you turn your head around then the viewing audience can't hear you.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: The northern edge I drew if you go for public comments that were submitted it follows it and I did not look at the map when I drew it because I grew up there and know it very well and can draw the line without being submitted and it matches what is on our public portal about the Arab American community on the north end.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Rothhorn then Commissioner Eid, please.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I'm just thinking about process. It feels good and a good start and I think we have to look at American community survey right sort of do some homework after this and just sort of test it out.

But I like the idea we have good rationale it feels good to me.

We had good back and forth.

I like the idea of saying okay we will stick with this.

Maybe another adjustment I'm not suggesting we have to but I like the idea of trying a second District and a third and then right because we will have to adjust everything but it just feels like we got a good start here and I like the rationale and the back and forth feels collaborative.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I would add too I mean I definitely think we can go a little in southwest Detroit a bit without trying to cut into Delray.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Yes, I would like to pass it on to the next Commissioner that has more experience in the area.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay all right Commissioner Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Thank you Madam Chair.

Okay, I'm going to try and tackle the Down River area.

And we are going to start right at the bottom, on the border of Monroe County.

I'm sorry the top border of Monroe County.

The big squiggly line.

Okay.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: My apologies Kent can you provide what the number of the District that Commissioner Vallette drew was? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 18.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: If you Zoom in and we will just take Townships here. And that would be Rockwood, Gibraltar, and Flat Rock.

Wood Haven and Trenton and Grosse Isle, Brownstown, River View.

Southgate, Wyandotte.

Allen Park, Lincoln Park, Ecorse.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Go Commissioner, Witjes, go.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Melvindale, River Rouge.

And then the four little precincts that are right in between Melvindale and River Rouge, yep. I think there might be two or three of them.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That area or less?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: I believe that's it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 12,900.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Witjes you might as well start giving your justification.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: My justification is just this in my opinion is the Down River area based off of my own personal knowledge as well as what public comments we have received.

In regards to the Down River area, communities of interest are being are going to be held here pretty well hold on, I change my wording, this is going to keep all the communities of interest together that identify as being in the Down River community.

I wish to thank Vice Chair Szetela for including Taylor in her District because that was turning out to be a nightmare when I was trying to do this particular District.

So that's always that was nice and I think that's all I have at this particular point.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: And Commissioner Witjes how did you take into account reflection of the state's diverse populations when drawing this District?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Well just by listening to what individuals were saying about this particular area during our listening tour.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I think that is what Mr. Adelson was asking for the Latino and Asian population to be reflected as well.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Probably we can do more than one at a time with this configuration.

That's something I could look at and study when we have a break or you know how many we can get loaded up at one time.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Now we are looking at Hispanic population greater than 10% which is a different color just so we don't get confused.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I believe Lincoln Park is 25% Latino.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: We are splitting them in two differ groups if we take them out so I would add the Lincoln Park and the straw back in.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Let me look at the thematic map one more time.

It does not appear to be behaving as I expect it.

It's not showing the percentages I expected it to.

I think we have.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: I would add Lincoln Park and the outing area back into it.

It may be something we can do in the House Districts.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Excuse me put Lincoln Park into 17.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Lincoln Park in 17 and the tiny little precincts at the top that we added.

Removed and are now adding again.

There we go and I will be done at this particular point.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you Commissioner Witjes.

I believe the next person is Commissioner Clark.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Okay let's go up towards the Pontiac area.

I'm most familiar with that.

It's the northern portion.

And northern part of Oakland County.

So I want to take Oakland Township, which it says Oakland so it's, yeah, I want to take all Oakland Township.

I want to go south and take all of Rochester and Rochester Hills.

Rochester is an island.

It's square mile inside of Rochester Hills so we have no choice.

Go south.

Choose Troy.

Troy.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Troy I'm sorry.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, it does, Asians on the west side of Troy.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Which I think is appropriate to include.

Where am I? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You need 68,000.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Okay so let's include Birmingham.

Bloomfield hills.

And Bloomfield Township which surrounds Bloomfield hills where are we at.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We are close to ideal .77 less than 1% high.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I think let me look at it again.

How far north we go.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Clark that looks good to me but this is your turn.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: What is that.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: It's your turn but it looks very good to me.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I tell you what is in my mind is lake Orion and Oxford but that would really put us over.

So I think that's more appropriate with independence Township and Brandon.

Okay I'm good with it.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Well you know what's next you have to answer your three questions Commissioner Clark.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I love my questions okay go ahead and ask me the questions.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I'm going to call on Commissioner Eid first.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So something I would suggest is instead of going west to Bloomfield and Bloomfield hills in Birmingham which I think are more so associated with West Bloomfield Orchard Lake, Keego Harbor and Sylvan may consider going right into Sterling Heights.

We heard plenty of times that you know Sterling Heights and Troy have things in common.

Especially with the minority communities.

And I think I mean I think just generally speaking knowing the area as Troy and Sterling Heights along with Rochester Hills and Oakland Township all have quite a lot in common with each other.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: So you're suggesting taking Bloomfield and Bloomfield hills out and Bloomfield Township out, keeping Birmingham in.

I would keep Birmingham in.

I want to ask Mr. Adelson a question.

When we move over to Sterling Heights, I think we will get more diversity.

Do you feel that we need more diversity in this area?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: That's a great question.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I think that you know as I mentioned at the beginning, considerations for diverse population is the third criteria and are different than under the Voting Rights Act and the 14th amendment of the U.S. Constitution.

So I think that my sense is that as you go as far as the third criteria you see what shaping up as you create a District.

So I know that that's somewhat ambiguous, that the criteria doesn't have the same like the preconditions for under Thornburg versus Gingles it's not as specific so I think that is really just going to depend on what your District looks like as it evolves, as you consider it.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK:

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you Commissioner Rothhorn, please.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Doug I was going to offer what I heard

Commissioner Eid suggest really would help us the Bangladesh community the Sterling Heights Warren area and Troy.

So what I mean to say is I think it's sort of answering the questions that the Secretary of State asked us which is how did you take into consideration diversity.

This would be okay moving away from West Bloomfield and moving into Sterling Heights is considering the Asian American and community of interest submissions we had.

It's an excellent example of what we are trying to do.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: It is, but Bangladesh people are also down in Warren.

So I don't know if we want to keep them together or not.

Well, we can do always do that in the House Districts.

Okay so let's take Bloomfield out, Bloomfield hills out.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Vice Chair Szetela?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, I was just going to on that same point say that the Bangladesh community was more in Warren along specific corridors by 94 so it's not so much adding to Bangladesh community although we did receive a lot of comment from Apac about Rochester and Rochester Hills and the Asian American communities up there which you already have included in this District so just some more food for thought.

If you leave this then you have the ability to put more Bangladesh people together with Sterling Heights and Warren and then possibly coming down to Highland Park so something to consider.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: If we leave it like it was.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes.

[Laughter]

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I understand, it's almost like they have a Senate District where they have majority of the people probably.
Or a good majority.

SEPTEMBER 9, 2021
5 PM

SEPTEMBER 9, 2021
5 PM

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: You are right, I'm so sorry.

So, Commissioner Curry, it's your turn.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can't hear you, but I can read your lips.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can you hear me now.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes, there is a delay but we can hear you.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: It's very faint as well Commissioner Curry.

If you could speak closer to you phone, I think that would help.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Make sure your phone volume is all the way up if you can.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay we are going to be in the Detroit area.

And can you turn, can you make that a little bit larger, the words? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commissioner, can you read it now?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Good if you can turn it up a little larger.

It feels very small for me.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I don't know that I can make the text larger at this point.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: With the counties.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Curry if there is an area if you call out the City Or Street or something so we can have a starting point.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: We will start near the Detroit area where river Rouge is and the southwest part of Detroit.

Let's see if I can find my glasses.

I can't see.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Right where I'm pointing is river Rouge Township.

This is Melvindale.

That's Delray right here.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: All right, okay we need how many people in this area? That I'm trying to choose? We need what the District.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The Senate District ideal target number is 265,193 people.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I see it, thank you.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's a lot of people.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: A whole lot.

I just can't read this map.

Can I go get my glasses, please? See.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Absolutely Commissioner Curry we want you to comfortably be able to see, yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Thank you.

Hold on.

A little bit better.

Okay, we have river Rouge here.

Delray because Delray is everybody is just about gone out of Delray.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Let me see.

Can you go up some more? Can you bring it in so I can see what the map looks like?

Can you bring it in some, please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Do you want me to Zoom in on a particular area?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I want you to bring it in so I can see the map.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You want to see more of the map or less?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: More.

Okay that is a little better.

Okay, let's do, let's start with okay if we start at the bottom down here with Ecorse, River Rouge, Detroit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay, so I'm going to highlight an area and you tell me if this is where what you're speaking of.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm speaking of Ecorse, river Rouge.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Detroit, and Delray has a do they have a number of population in it? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That census block that is highlighted are precinct that is highlighted right here has 596 people in it.

This has.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yeah, it's just about empty.

They are rebuilding over there though.

Okay, you can bring it back in a little bit so I can see how this map is looking.

Okay, my color is what purple? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, ma'am.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay can you put Ecorse with that? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area here? Or south? I'm sorry.

Ecorse I'm sorry.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay, make sure you keep the numbers with it okay Ecorse has 9,000.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 9305.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And then give me also river Rouge.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: River Rouge is in 15 now.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Is it selected? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Ecorse, river Rouge, and it's.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Detroit.

And do you know what is happening? Move up some and go past, okay, to Detroit.

Now it's kind of strange but Hamtramck is near across the street like from Detroit.

So it's like Lincoln Park.

Allendale and Melvindale.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Curry you have hands and I know you don't like to be interrupted in your thought and do you want to finish your thought first and then I have two hands up.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I would like to see what it looks like together.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Include Lincoln Park?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Include Lincoln Park.

I'm trying to see what it looks like first.

And include Melvindale.

Okay and then all of Detroit.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Curry do you see that there has already been a District outlined where you are filling in that there is a blue area? Just as a clarification point.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I am just seeing the blue area now.

I did not see it before.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: What you selected and assigned is over the blue area so that is why I asked you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay I didn't see it.

I do see Lincoln Park so that is not in the blue area.

Okay.

So.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I was excuse me Commissioner Curry, Lincoln Park, Ecorse were in District 17 prior to you putting them in 15.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Are you saying I can't change it? Are you saying I can change it?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: You can.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY:

>> CHAIR KELLUM: You can change it we had a lengthy discussion prior to about communities of interest and just keeping in mind the population Latino population in Delray and the things we discussed earlier but it's totally up to you.

It's your turn like Commissioner Eid will have a turn after you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And I want to go south of there and Delray has nobody.

Okay let's go up and pick Detroit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Are you saying the gold lines are voting precincts. Are you saying to assign the area heading to Detroit, all this area?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I really don't -- is this part of Detroit right here? That is right next to river Rouge and Melvindale?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Is that part of Detroit? Kent cannot...I can highlight Detroit Township boundaries if you would like.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Would you, please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is all of the Detroit Township.

And it has 639,111 people.

Which works out in the vicinity of well over two districts, closer to 2.5 Senate districts.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: The over population.

What are with we making here with Detroit? Is that going to be 14 or is that 19? I know it's not 19, I know it's not 15 but what is it? Are we on number 16 for the District? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You're working on District 15 which is in purple, where my cursor is.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: How come it went yellow on me.

If I'm working in 15?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I think he was highlighting the area you were working in.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I was working in the purple.

Okay now Detroit can be with it, it should be purple, shouldn't it? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The Detroit Township is highlighted in yellow.

It holds you want me to assign that to 15?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay this, okay, we have to have a total of 265,000 population.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes, Commissioner Curry.

Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: So we only have 60 we are not there yet, right, and if y'all don't like it you can change it but I'm trying to see the way that I would draw it.

Okay, so that is the purple for Detroit.

You got Delray in there.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Are you wanting Kent to fill in all the other spaces or just leave it as it is?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Fill in the spaces.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Vice Chair Szetela and then Commissioner Clark please.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So Juanita when he is using that select box it shows up as yellow.

So that's what he is asking you if you want to assign when he puts that select box out it will show the area he selected as yellow and he wants to know if you want to put it in the purple that is what he is asking that is where the miss understanding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, in the purple.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You want that yellow area made purple, is that right?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes, okay.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Clark do you still have a question?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I do.

I completely disagree with what you've done in the southern part.

It used to be in District is it 17 in the light blue.

Because we've deleted population from them.

And now we've got to make it up for 17.

And, yeah, but that is a whole redo of everything we've done.

So we need to keep that in mind once we finish with the District, you're working on we got to go makeup the numbers for 17 to make that whole because, yeah.

So.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm just trying to.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I'm not that familiar with this area of the state.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm very familiar with it, I'm very familiar with it.

I'm familiar so much with it I know that Lincoln Park is pretty mixed now.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: Okay I appreciate that.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Melvindale is getting very mixed.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I just wanted to point that out that we have a deficit to makeup on 17 because of going to this direction.

Okay I yield.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You all wanted me to go my view of what I wanted the map to look like.

Or I'll just pass and you guys can finish it.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Curry what did you say I didn't hear you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I said I will pass so you guys can finish it.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay I mean it's your turn.

So.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I thought it was.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes, so it was just Commissioner Clark just made a suggestion.

You don't have to take that suggestion.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: No honey I know it was just a suggestion but I thought that we all were putting in our suggestions and then somebody wanted to go back over and redo it that is fine.

But I wanted to kind of finish looking at what it would look like if I made it that way.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay you can do that.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: But if it's something you all don't want to deal with then I can pass on it.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Vice Chair Szetela?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I would light to see what you have in mind for the District so please finish Juanita.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Thank you.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: And just to be clear and I said it before Commissioner Curry prefers if suggestions are made after, but I would implore us to just take your turn and maybe those suggestions could be expressed in the turn you take.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Thank you.

Okay, now can we kind of bring it in some? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is Kent.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: So I can see the larger portion so I can see what the map looks like.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: More of the map.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: She wants you to Zoom out so she can see the map of Detroit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Is that better? Commissioner Curry I could overlay aerial photography if it would help identify areas.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can see Detroit.

I can see Highland Park.

Hamtramck.

I think the lady previously said she wanted Grosse Pointe to be in the Down River area. Or somewhere near Detroit.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Gross Isle.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I want to see what it looks like if you color it purple in what I'm pointing out and if it doesn't look right, I will change it.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Kent what I'm hearing Commissioner Curry is mentioning can you fill those in with purple and you don't have to ask her, is she sure those are the areas she is asking and she will make adjustments after.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You want mill to bring it all the way up to Grosse Pointe; is that correct? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commissioner Curry, this is Kent, I just need to be specifically told what to assign.

I don't want to be responsible for assigning it.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm asking, I've been asking from the get-go if you will do Detroit in purple.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, ma'am.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: It's still yell and looks like it won't go purple.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: It takes a special Commissioner Curry for the colors to change.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'm doing it a piece of the time just to see what the numbers are.

Commissioner Curry we need 76,000 more people.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay you guys put Dearborn with Taylor so far and Taylor is nowhere near Dearborn.

Do Dearborn Heights and Dearborn.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: District 15 is 24% high or 64,000 too many people.

We need to.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Take that off.

And let's go with Allen Park.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I agree Commissioner Curry I don't think Allen Park should go in there either I agree.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Take Allen Park out.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Why?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I agree with the community we created before the District that we created before the Allen Park Lincoln Park.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I didn't hear you all earlier so I just want to know why.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: So the blue is the area, there is an area that is shaded darker to the left of the purple, that is a district that says 19.

It's already been created.

And then right below that kind of brownish darkish shape there is this kind of light color. That was District 17.

You have drawn in area 15 this kind of purple area that is overlaying and then shifting up the shore north.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I have not finished drawing yet.

I'm trying to see what it looks like in my mind, okay.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And I'm not saying that is my final thought on it.

I'm just trying to see what it looks like because where I'm sitting at now, I'm surrounded by Allen Park, Dearborn, Lincoln Park river rouge Ecorse and even Wyandotte so I'm trying to see how it would look on the map.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I totally understand I'm just making sure you can see what is on the map because I know some areas you can't.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can see all of it now.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: You see the brown.

You see the blue.

You see 1917.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Dearborn, Dearborn Heights in.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Rock and roll take your turn.

You got it.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Wyandotte, River View, and Brown Stone.

I see that in the light blue and gross Isle.

Take off Lincoln Park, Melvindale and Allen Park.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, ma'am okay it's unassigned.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: It really looks like it's.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: District 15 is short of the 98,995 ideal District number.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: How many.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 98,995.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Let me see a portion of Highland Park and Hamtramck.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Excuse me I'm sorry I didn't hear all of that.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Highland Park and Hamtramck.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Highland Park.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: I believe she said Highland Park and Hamtramck.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: She did.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Which is to the north.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Highland Park.

I see it now I'm sorry.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Those two.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: What is the population total.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: For now it's 70,000.

And we would need to make this District contiguous.

It's in separate pieces so we could join this.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Would you please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Lange?

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I'm sorry, Juanita, are you talking by phone and if so, is there a way you can talk more directly into it? ASL and myself are having a hard time hearing.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm bending over talking into my computer.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I can't get any closer, I will be kissing the screen.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commissioner Curry we are at 43,912 people short of what is considered the ideal direct number.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Okay now can you make it smaller so I can see the whole map? Please?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Curry this is my last bug this is Commissioner Kellum can you try holding the phone in your hand so that the speaker is next to your mouth? If it doesn't work it doesn't work.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: My computer is working now.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: The phone has been off for the last 15, 20 minutes.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Are we at the right scale Commissioner Curry for you to see what you need.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Kind of looks like it.

Can you bring it in a little bit more? No, bring it out.

Seems like it should be brought in though.

Bring it out some more.

Okay what is so 17 was already in.

You all had 17 already made up is that right.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes 17 and 19 were already completed.

And now 17 has an unassigned area, but it's still your turn so it's up to you whether you want to fill it back in.

He can easily restore 17.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I'm just trying to figure out why you put Taylor with Detroit.

They are not near each other.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: We put Taylor Dearborn and Dearborn Heights together because of what the communities in Dearborn and Dearborn Heights expressed and then in terms of my knowledge I don't see Taylor fitting with any -- I would not put Taylor with Romulus and definitely wouldn't put it with Lincoln Park and Melvindale but there are other Commissioners pardon me.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Go with Dearborn.

We are right across the street from Dearborn, Detroit is.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: So Detroit is now we are across the street from lots of places but that doesn't mean that those people in those communities if that would be best suited for a District.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I guess Detroit.

I'm only speaking for my community.

I don't know I have heard what the people said but I'm trying to do what is right with Detroit.

So since I am part of Detroit too.

And I'm going to pass right now.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Okay Commissioner Curry can you provide some justifications for Michigan Department of State for District 15?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, because you guys have already designed it the way you guys want it so you can deal with it.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Eid are you ready to take your turn?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, I am.

I'll just get my glasses.

So are we -- we have like a we have differing districts now so I think it would be appropriate to have both of them saved so we have all of the ideas archived somewhere.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

So let's do that first just to make sure we don't lose what we had previously and make sure we don't lose what Commissioner Curry just did.

And then we can go from there.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You can lose what I just did because it's a population is not even enough to make up for Detroit.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: It's okay Commissioner.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Curry and Detroit is totally by itself more or less.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Okay Commissioner Eid is choosing to have a copy of your work and everyone else's so he is going to keep a copy and will continue to do his additions so it will be fine.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, sir.

Just give me one minute.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You don't have to keep a copy of my work because it's not complete.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commissioner Eid this is a copy.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Okay, originally, I was going to try to examine if there was a way Taylor could be incorporated into a Down River community because I believe there is a lot of evidence that Taylor is at least a little bit more of a Down River-ish community than it is with Dearborn.

But considering our time restraints that we have today and the fact that I'd like to you know get a whole map done as soon as possible I'll instead go to my hometown of Orchard Lake and go from there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: All right where is that?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So if you go to the little northwest, back to the suburbs. Yeah, right over there, you are right in the middle of it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Orchard Lake right there.

This will be District 14.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Sure.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And we have Townships up.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, so let's take West Bloomfield, Orchard Lake. Sylvan Lake, I'm sorry my frame my screen just froze for a second. Keego Harbor.

Wonderful.

All of commerce Township to the left.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commerce to the left.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Bloomfield, Bloomfield hills.

But no Wixom and not Walled lake who I believe is more closely associated with Novi, Farmington and Farmington Hills.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I will agree Kent cannot Farmington Hills?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: No go to the right to Bloomfield and Bloomfield hills.
And then that so we have just that top Township of Southfield right there.
Not the entire you see how there is two Southfields just that part.
And the right of it Royal Oak.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: To the right is that what.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, Royal Oak toward the bottom right there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: All of Royal Oak? Eid aye all of Royal Oak.

Where does that leave us on population.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 27, 712 people short which is approximately 10.4%.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Well, what I would like to do is you know and I highlight originally, I thought of this District being was including Birmingham.
And I know Commissioner Clark just had Birmingham being with Troy but I'm wondering if we put it with West Bloomfield Orchard Lake Bloomfield, Bloomfield hills we can probably include a little bit more of Sterling Heights along with Troy and it might work.
So let's go ahead and assign Birmingham to this District as well.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Berkeley would also work with Royal Oak because it's so very close to Royal Oak.

I can bike and walk.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Let try with Berkeley then you won't have to change.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You will be about 10,000 over.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Curry? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: With Birmingham and Berkeley.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Curry we can't hear you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can you hear me now.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: This is the clearest you ever sounded yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Good I'm sorry I didn't have the mute off.

But any how you are all talking about how close Berkeley is to whatever.

What is it Berkeley to Royal Oak

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: That is the only thing I was saying about Detroit it's sitting right next to Lincoln Park and Allen Park, River Rouge, and Ecorse. And to break those up you will disservice Detroit. And Lincoln Park, Allen Park, Allen Park and Lincoln Park are just about half the ratio for the Black and whites are half and half just about now.

And then you got the what is those people called that wear the black? What are they?
But any how I'm just saying when you leave Detroit kind of by itself, you're taking away everything that is right across the street from Detroit.

You can walk I can walk across the street and be in Allen Park Lincoln Park Dearborn all those Townships.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I think that's appropriate.

That would be the way I would go about it.

Since I completed drawing a District I don't know if it's still my turn.

But you know I'll defer to the Chair and to the rules for that.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Is there something in your District you wanted to change Anthony?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: What we wanted to change, Brittini, is adding on to 16, District 16 another row of Townships in Sterling Heights.

Because he took population away when he moved Birmingham over to his District.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay that change would be up to Commissioner Eid and if so, he can make that change and then provide.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: What I'm asking of Commissioner Eid is that he continue on to try to make that District whole as well.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yeah, I think add more of Sterling Heights into 16 until we get okay with population.

I think the rationale is exactly the same as when you made District 16.

Because of that you see the dots that we have there.

They are displayed on the board and are those still dots of Asian American ancestry?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, sir the Asian over 10 percent Asian right here says population total Asian.

And we can click on each one and you will see it's highlighting but let me change it.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I would as many of those dotted precincts as possible until we get to the population needed for that Troy-based District.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: And I think by doing that it also further supports what Bruce's comments previously when we talked about that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commissioner Eid are you requesting I assign the voting precincts to 16?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Don't you think you ought to keep Berkeley with Orchard Lake, Anthony?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Excuse me District 16 now is .25% over.
654 people with minority population of 28.36%.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Wonderful to answer Commissioner Curry's question I wouldn't put Berkeley with it because that would put us over population and I see Berkeley as being more so associated with Southfield hunting ton and really more so hunting ton the Woods oak park and pleasant ridge and Ferndale and Hazel park than it is with Orchard Lake.

I mean I have -- I have gone to Royal Oak growing up many, many times.

There is a lot of activities for you know all types of people to do out there.

And people travel to Royal Oak frequently via Woodward.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

The similarities between commerce and West Bloomfield and/or charred lake given that we need population because you can't have it be on its own because we are working on the Senate District, I think they should go together.

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay, well commerce actually has two school districts.

Walled lake schools and Huron valley schools which is also mill Ford and Highland.

And White Lake has Huron valley schools also.

So I really don't understand why you took commerce out because now 18 lacks almost 50,000 people.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I think Commissioner Eid is pretty satisfied with what he has drawn so Commissioner Curry?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I just kind of think that I didn't do it but it appears that way that we are saying this is when we talk about the different Townships and districts and whatever we are saying I'm only going by what I know.

And then when you -- what it appears to me now from what I know living in Detroit is that Dearborn all those little towns, Allen Park Lincoln Park all those places at one time were very prejudice.

Very prejudice.

And I thought we were trying to keep things where they were more contiguous or do we want to keep everything prejudice? Because that's what I was trying to do.

Not that I thought that just trying to add all those people would make everybody happy. It just seemed like when I go down my street, I'm seeing every kind of color.

Everything.

All kind of mixed people.

But the way it looked like it's going is that looked like you all trying to keep whites in white neighborhood.

And the Chaldeans in one neighborhood.

Or are we going to be kind of where we you know share the growth, the wealth, everything.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: So Commissioner Curry I completely hear you.

If I was looking at what was drawn like what you drew for Detroit, I actually had some thoughts about integrating Ferndale with Detroit with some suburbs so you can get a mix of resources.

But it's such a stretched out area of 15 now so I have to kind of think about where would be.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: You can do whatever with 15.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: We have a copy of it and it's fine.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: I did not finish it because I was getting so many and probably because I wasn't there earlier or yesterday.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But I'm under the impression that people were saying when we went to these meetings that they wanted to be more into who all went in there.

Like for instance you know you got Chaldeans in Detroit shopping and going places.

But Detroiters really not participating in the Chaldeans thing.

And so you got in Dearborn Heights.

I know they are all kind of set to their selves and Lincoln Park used to be one culture, one minority.

One they were all just about white people.

And in river Woods and Ecorse and Detroit they are mostly all Black people.

So I'm under the impression that people wanted to kind of be mixed a little bit since all these places are just a step over into another you can step over into Lincoln Park you can step over into Allen Park, you can step over in river Rouge you can almost step over to Wyandotte is south beach you got to drive a little ways and Taylor and the places are contiguous to me because I see everybody in all those areas and I just didn't want to separate them.

But if you all thought they should be separated that's just not my.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I respect your opinion and we just continue to take turns and get public feedback and continue to draft and remix and redo and erase and fill back in as we get feedback.

And we have to start somewhere.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: That's true.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I'm going to attempt to take my turn.

Kent, can we so we've made a copy, is there another question that I missed?

Commissioner Orton I'm sorry?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: You can have your turn.

But I just wanted to add something I feel like we are having a couple different conversations here but to what I'm saying we are making a collaborative map so we can work together.

But if any Commissioner has a strong opinion or a better idea, they can make their own and present it and we can also discuss that one.

And present it or you know decide whether to present it.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Thank you Commissioner Orton.

Okay, hum can you go down a little bit, Kent so I can see the map.

Let's see what is happening here.

Zoom back in.

I'm stuck because I'm thinking of two things and I don't know how complicated it's going to be.

So we have a copy of 15 but if we were to just remove that altogether so I can just have a fresh look at what that area is.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, ma'am.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Lincoln Park Allen Park Ecorse and Wyandotte, Commissioners please do chime in and let me know if I'm incorrect.

Or affirm with an audible yes.

Commissioner Witjes?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Looking at the one you drew, so Melvindale, River Rouge, Allen Park, Ecorse, Lincoln Park all the way down to the border. And in that little Section that is jutting out on the precinct level.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Does that appear to be what we had previously?

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Should be 789 off of ideal.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is where we are at 789.

We do have to go to blocks here and grab this block so that we pick up this island.

Can I do that?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Please do that, Kent.

It's slow when we are using blocks because you have to be zoomed in so far.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: That is okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: But that is the nature of it.

I think that is pretty much it.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Can we go towards Ferndale, so Zoom in.

I realize you're not from this area so it doesn't resonate in your brain the same.

Go north a little, north and go towards the east.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Ferndale.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Let's see what happens.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Wow.

I will be back.

This thing you click on one spot and it takes off.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: This is challenging to work with.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: District 13.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I want to select Ferndale and Royal Oak and pleasant ridge and Huntington Woods.

Huntington Woods and pleasant ridge.

And I want to can you Zoom in some more? I need to have a different view of Detroit in order to try.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I can bring streets up.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I can't see you and take a turn tap the mic and say Chair and kind of prompt me to call on you.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Because we are in Southfield, there was LGBT community request to keep Southfield, Oak Park, Huntington Woods, Ferndale, and Hazel Park together if possible.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

So I do think that would be an appropriate place to maybe stop that District like you were doing.

So I agree.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Same.

I wanted to include some Ferndale in there to build community and also because Ferndale Royal Oak are walkable and bleed into each other and there is a historic if we think about the riots in Detroit and that there is still a you know a meeting going down 8 mile and Woodward that are still the physical representations of that racial discrimination of different communities.

That's my thinking when I look into that.

But I do see this kind of weird unassigned area.

What is that Moross if I'm looking correctly? And Shay, no.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Cumberland Manor Apartments and Palmer Park.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: You can select that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Excuse me.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: You can select that, please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay, not that, I'm getting there.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: No, no, no.

We can have people step on my toes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: No, that is not going to happen.

These are fairly low populated voting.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Nothing over there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 834 people here.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Rothhorn?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Because you just added a palmer park area, that was another LGBTQ potential residential COI.

And the Hazel Park was I think, yeah, I don't know if you intentionally did not include it but that was the last piece that was sort of.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Hazel Park is fine it's not intentional I'm trying to keep track and see so, yes, I appreciate, it was not intentional.

Mr. Adelson?

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: Excuse me thank you.

I wanted to point out that the in Dr. Handley's study she identified packing in a handful of Senate districts.

They are not as significant in numerically as in the house.

But she did suggest, and this is something you know I'm sure we will be talking about the percentages are smaller so that if, for example, in a 54% current District majority Black District that she concluded that 5 voters can elect their candidates of choice under 50% and there's a fair amount of cross over voting in Wayne County.

So I think that that's something also to keep in mind.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I'm going to stop there for my turn actually.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You are still 35,000 people short, 13.5%.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I know.

And go can you Zoom in-to-the area that is to the right of University of Detroit mercy.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, ma'am.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Because I think you will end up selecting that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There is a Magnet Middle School and Florence Grove.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes, you have to select all of that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: About that.

Shall we continue south?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Please select that 932.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Select that yes.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: The 1133 and then yes that little area above.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Those precincts cross over the route 10 or highway 10.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Take out 932.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Take out the entire precinct.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: The census one.

Thank you for correcting me.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Still need 31,000 people.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: DPS-Robison academy.

Let me Zoom back in.

Zoom in please.

So that area, that is DPS, Robison, that neighborhood.

You can select I'm just going by what I can't read the Citgo gas station, the school, the streets that are around that neighboring that area.

So probably ending assigning the areas that you probably just took off honestly.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'll just put it back and then you can reevaluate.

That's the entire precinct.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I just need the block so from block eight and block 35, 37, 36, 13 is there a way to not take in that whole area and make it over? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Sure so you want to remove these.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Am I over or under.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You still have 30,000 people.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Then select 3253.

I'm reading the block.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Where are we at up here.

Yes, this whole area down through here? Shall we just take it down to the commercial.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: That is fine and you can do the area to the left.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'm just getting the little unpopulated blocks up next to the highway so you didn't have little holes.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area.

Let me get it to precincts.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: 662 on 546 that one too.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This one up here 1197.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: And the one to the left, up.

>> Kent: This, we just removed these earlier.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I know.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is okay.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: If I say witness a smile maybe you won't be as angry.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 1069 this is Linden Detroit terminal.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Zoom in, please and go to the left.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is the play field, ball field.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Can we have the one that includes Butzel and Zoom in so we can see 1458.

I probably won't.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Warehouse and stone works.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: That one and the one above and the one above that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This whole area.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Let me see though Zoom out Kent.

Take away the little oblong pieces to the left.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Take out these pieces here.

You still have 24,000 people to add.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Jesus.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You still want me to take them out?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: No.

Zoom out.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I will get a bigger vision.

This is.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay that is enough.

I'm going to stop.

I know that I have a difference of about 24,000 people.

But I want to stop because I want to come up for air and see what I have.

My intent was to take in consideration the patterns of the smaller suburbs that bleed into Detroit as well as the communities that surround the areas regarding 8 mile and Woodward.

And to also incorporate the comments from the public hearing and the COIs and analysis of that data for those LBGTQ communities African/American communities, the

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

suburban communities of pleasant ridge Ferndale and Royal Oak that expressed commonalities in keeping them together so those would be my justifications for drawing District 13 this way.

And Commissioners please do way in even if you are not from the City of Detroit.

And I'm not in love with it but it's a starting point and represents a direction.

Commissioner Rothhorn, please?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: So my question is do you see sort of like so there was a one of the ways so we want to make sure there is a not as much African/American packed into any District so with this one do you see loss a logic so to speak and should there are spokes in Detroit does it make sense to try to sort of, yeah, Woodward east and west right and just continue up the spokes is that sort of.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes, it does make sense.

But I grew tired of drawing so I wanted, I took a siesta of my turn.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I just wanted to understand it.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Orton please.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Can we take a five minute break and maybe we can finish that one when we come back?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Sure.

But don't put the pressure all on me.

Just saying that.

So we will take a five minute recess.

That means we will come back at I'm sorry Commissioner Lange? Please forgive me.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: I'm concerned with taking a five minute break when we've got like 49 minutes left of the meeting.

It doesn't seem appreciate to take a break at this stage of the meeting when our concern is getting maps done.

I mean I don't know.

I mean that's what the Commission wants but I mean we are so far in and almost at the end.

And it just seems counterproductive.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you Commissioner Lange.

I personally have to go to the rest room.

So.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: It's very hot in here and I need to step outside for a bit.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: We will take five minute and return at 7:16 exactly that is all you get is five minutes.

[Recess]

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I will bring the independent citizens redistricting Commission back to order at 7:19 p.m. will Michigan Department of State staff please call the roll.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Zoom in where.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I said I'm going to leave it as is I'm going to leave it where it is right now.

I have some ideas where people I would take things but for as the essence of time, I'm going to stop my turn.

Michigan Department of State, do you need any more justification than what I provided?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Yes, I'm just going to go through just a few questions. Can you explain why this District took the shape that it did?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: It took the interesting shape that it did to account for the feedback we received in our COI analysis, public hearings as well as the perimeters that we have for our active matrix.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Can you be a little more specific about what public feedback or what COIs for example?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes, as I've said before there is a lot of talk about the communities of Ferndale Royal Oak pleasant ridge having been walkable epicenters. Art communities.

LGBTQAI community friendly and those folks that share their opinions also expressed wanting to not only be together but also be with the Southfield community.

And these neighborhoods also so very closely border Detroit and there would be some nexus between those spaces and communities.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: The last question is a bit of a two parter, how did you consider minority populations in this area? And did you consider if this District is considered packed?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Well we heard from our good friend Bruce Adelson who provided some guidance, things to be careful of and this was not an area as drafted that at present should cause for great concern.

What was the first part? I think I answered one part but didn't get the first part of your question.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: How would you consider minority populations in this area and did you consider if this District is packed?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Right.

So the minority populations we used the data as expressed.

And those also those populations also expressed by those that share comments from the residents who live in the area and then we asked Mr. Adelson if this is an area of concern for packing.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT:

>> CHAIR KELLUM: The next Commissioner would be Commissioner Lange.

>> COMMISSIONER LANGE: Okay I'm going to have Kent if you would please Zoom out for me and I want to pick up all of Canton to the south.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I see it now, thank you.

SEPTEMBER 13, 2021

SEPTEMBER 13, 2021

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Well, no, but let's see what it does now you have done it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's 2800 people.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And it puts it at 1.55% low.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Commissioner Rothhorn? Do we need more or less?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN:

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Commissioner Rothhorn thinks we are good so I will stop.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Lett be prepared for your three questions coming from Michigan Department of State.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Ask away.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Could you describe so we will start with District 11. Could you describe why your District 11 took the shape that it did?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Well, it took the shape that it did so we didn't box ourselves in.

So starting from the western side of that District and moving east, giving us room as we get closer into Wayne County, Detroit and the other counties if we are still in them.

So that was why we started there.

I started there.

And 12, I'll do the same question that we started when we started with 12 was because we made some changes to it with 11.

So we had some changes with 12.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Good thank you.

How did you consider communities of interest when drawing these districts? We can again start with 11 and then proceed to 12.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Well, the communities of interest as I understand it from the other Commissioners were that these are natural communities that would normally go together, have gone together and continue to go together.

In addition there were several comments regarding school districts, which we tried to accommodate.

And the same would be said of 12.

Whatever the comments I don't recall what the comments were on 12 previously but the same comments would apply to the changes I made in 12.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you and Commissioner Szetela I know you provided some help to Commissioner Lett as he was drawing this, do you have anything to add to that.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: We received a lot of public commentary over the weekend about south Lyon not being as much affiliated with Canton Plymouth area and more so with Novi in the corridor between south Lyon and Novi they have a bike trail

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you.

Our next Commissioner to take a turn would be Commissioner Orton.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, well, I guess so that we don't paint ourselves into a corner I better take this Inkster Westland Garden City area and I will need input of course.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: She didn't even say anything Commissioner Rothhorn.
Commissioner Rothhorn.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: It's about an overlay because we are going to be approaching the Detroit City of Detroit and Kent said he has the overlay for the City neighborhoods it might be useful as you draw to understand when you are getting into Detroit.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: There is no my but will be because it doesn't have any of the markers any place else.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Can you take care of that, Kent, the overlay? Law.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Vice Chair Szetela please.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I don't know if you will make it to Detroit with the populations and once you add in Livonia and read Ford if you need to go in Detroit. You might need to be I don't know if you will need to.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There are the neighborhoods and they are over in Detroit so there is a ways to go before we.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay so can you starting there with Westland, Garden City and Livonia can you choose all of that?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Orton you may not have to choose Livonia we will end up with an awkward shape but I would kind of bend the corner and stay low and come up to read Ford but go ahead.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: What else could Livonia go with?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: We could have to go back and do some other things.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Commissioner Orton are you saying assign this area to ten?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes, please.

If you click Township, I think it will select all of Westland.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I was thinking Wayne was in there but it's not.
And you need 126,000 more people.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, I'd like to see population of Townships, I guess.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: All Livonia is 95,000 a fair piece has been taken out of it.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, well, I think we're going to have to take that unless somebody has an idea of where else we would be able to use that.

So Commissioner Kellom are you thinking that Garden City and Westland do not associate with Livonia?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: They do.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

But I just think there is more association thinking of the Inkster area and where it kind of although Bruce is not here thinking of the VRA standards and all that.

So I don't have a fix for Livonia.

I just have an idea of what to include for ten.

So I don't have a nice tidy answer. I was just thinking of putting Redford at the lossier area in with Garden City, Inkster and Westland, thinking of the communities. But Vice Chair Szetela has a hand.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Livonia is a big area and the way I think of the Metro Detroit area, sorry I will take this off so you can hear me better the way I think of the Metro Detroit you have Detroit and what I call first ring suburbs which are houses from the 1950s, that are in subdivisions that are relatively close together with like 50 foot lots. The southwest portion of Livonia is very much like that.

So it's very similar to Redford and Garden City and Westland in terms of the style of houses the type of houses and the communities and built around parks and older bungalows and older ranches from the 1950s.

As you go north in Livonia you get into newer subsidy version type areas that are what I would call second ring 1970s housing is more spread out more colonials.

So I think although I don't necessarily want to see Livonia carved up into three pieces, I think it might make sense to take Livonia south of 8 mile potentially or maybe 7-Mile and combine that with read Ford and then or just I mean depending on population maybe just take all of Livonia and combine it with read Ford.

You have to see what your numbers are because you have 95 in Livonia and there is quite a bit already off.

But if you segregate, I would say north, south you get in the first ring versus second ring and the first ring are more like Garden City Westland Inkster, Redford.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: MC?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I'm thinking about the data you could show. Like the dots we get with some and so maybe some demographic help might, yeah, might be helpful.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I will also say there is a population for I mean this is a lit bit anecdotal African/Americans lives in the City of Detroit the City they could be most likely to move into would be a Westland or a Garden City area.

Least likely to be northern side of Livonia if that makes any sense that is why I was thinking of when I think of Redford, there is no possibility of where I will put Redford anywhere else or Redford Township but that is just my guess.

Like it would not be appropriate to put it with 13 and thinking of the work we have to do with the neighboring districts.

So we've just done something awkward with the Livonia the suburban area and that is why it's like that.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON:

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Keep in mind if you take all of Livonia you will have to fix 12.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I think since we took off quite a bit of Livonia with 12 you might actually have the population if you put both the rest of Livonia and Redford in here.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Anyone else? Lots of good tips.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Clark then Vice Chair Szetela, please.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I agree with what Rebecca said.

You know, you go north to 7-Mile you have by Centennial park and then you get the newer parts of Livonia build up where it's south of 7-Mile or by Centennial park. It's the older districts.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So would that be that line right there where the word Livonia is on? That road?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: That's the freeway right there.

The white one is the freeway that is Jeffreys then you have 5 mile.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: You're talking about below there Szetela sed I would start there and put in Redford and see what your population is at.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Kent would you start there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area I have.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes, all that area and then to the right, same area but Redford.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: To the right.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Redford Township.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Just to the same height as.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Not all of Redford.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Right, first let's just try this.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You still need about 85,000 people approximately.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Could we have that neighborhood overlay again? Seems like it was about there that it started.

Perfect.

Okay, then how do you guys feel about the rest of Livonia and Redford that is not included in those neighborhood lines?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'm not assigning them, I'm just highlighting it to see what kind of numbers we have.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Clark?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That area contains 43,000 and you need 84.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I would say that is reasonable.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I think with Anthony he recommended a few minutes ago.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That area all of that you would still be light.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Well assign all that please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: See if you can take it to green field and see what happens and you might not be able to see That Street.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So into Detroit.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Take that whole puzzle and line it up where Dearborn is.

Just even it out.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You still need about 12000 and you are running right down the edge of these neighborhoods.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: What area are you talking about Brittini?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: All the areas that are empty I would just fill in because.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: It will be too much.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Now this is a community that I would not break up because if you take bright more, this is a huge community so that is why I was encouraging to take this on before you chipped into Livonia.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You're talking about just Brightmoor?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I would have taken Redford Township, Redford Brighton or Elijah would have taken that all the way to Greenfield.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: The idea that the northern Livonia Section could fit with 11, 11 is under populated and therefore to keep the community together as Brittini is suggesting may work.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yeah, that is the area he is talking about and down further.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That area is 24,000.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, can you choose what you did but fill in clear down to the straight line? I don't know what roads these are.
Further.

Yeah.

Square it off.

And then I think even further was it.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 33,000 people.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay so can you assign that to or unassign it for right now, I guess.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Where is that in relation to 7-Mile road? Can we tell in Livonia? In my mind that's still the should be the cutoff.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: 7-Mile is that line that's, you can't see.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Can we expand that so we can see the names of the roads.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is the main highway.
That is Lynden.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Go a little north of there.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Two miles.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There is five mile.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Five mile.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Six mile and seven mile.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Is that a good place to choose for now? Or should it be north of there?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I don't know where we are at population wise.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Unassigned area has 33,000 people.
Keep in mind it has to go somewhere.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I know that is the problem.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: How much do we need in 11?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 11 is .24.

10 percent of the District is about 26,500 so you are closer to...

COMMISSIONER CLARK: We can put some in 12 too.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Well for right now Zoom in a little bit to just the edge of those neighborhoods.

And can you select a chunk of that? Are you thinking the southern chunk of that? Is that what you're talking about Commissioner Kellom?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Zoomed in hold on the southern chunk of.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: The neighborhoods that are highlighted.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I mean this is jumping ahead I probably need to make additions to District 13 that I created too but any who.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: District 13 is overpopulated at the moment.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yeah, so she can take.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I don't think we will be able to take much of that.
I think the population is going to be quite high.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Uh-huh.

So you can take some off of 13.

That little tail to the right.

Not that, east right there, yep.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: That won't work for ten.

We won't be able to get there.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay, sorry.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I just am not sure which of these areas by Redford where the neighborhood outlines start.

I'm not sure which ones associate with the area that we are putting in ten.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: You can select that area.

That's fine, Brightmoor, Elijah Howell, Castle, Rogue. I was trying to talk. Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I'm not sure I would put any of that in 10. I think I would be more concerned about the blank space over in Livonia and splitting that up between 11 and 12.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Should we fix 11 and 12 first? And then see what we do?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I guess we can always come back to that. Well, the reason I suggest that is because we may not use all of that blank space and we may want to assign some of it to ten.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Right.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So when we are saying fix 11 and 12 it looks like 11 is okay.

12 is a little short on population so it's within 2%.

But then 13 is down 25,000 people.

So.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Over.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 13 is over 24,000.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Never mind.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay well.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Szetela?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I honestly would just say keep Livonia in ten.

Were we over when we had that other area? No.

We were still short.

How short were we? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: About 12000 people.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: About 12000.

So we could potentially take some off of 13 on the other side, that is Grand River, right? Is it Grand River diagonally?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: For right now Kent assign that to ten.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Take a little part north of Grand River and maybe assign that into ten.

Yeah, that little part up there.

It's very densely populated, so.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That one precinct has a 1500 people in it.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

These neighborhoods dissect as you would expect voting precincts.

So if we are going to really stick to the neighborhood lines, we need to use census blocks like right here.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So where would you cut on that? Is Commissioner Curry on? Commissioner on? Commissioner Curry, are you familiar with this part of Detroit? We can't hear you if you are talking.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, I'm somewhat familiar with it, yes.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Which of the areas do you feel would best go with the Redford the ten, District ten that we are creating?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Can you take any of the upper part of Dearborn Heights and kind of mix it with Redford? I can't hardly read the words to.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: We could do that, but we are over population over population in 13 whereas 19 is pretty good where it's at so we were looking a taking some from 13 because we are 26,000 over in 13 and we are under in 10.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: What about those first three? Can you choose those? You can't see where I'm pointing.
Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 5.7. This area here or this area?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: The three, yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I'm going to select an area, you tell me if you like it.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: That would go good with Redford.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Unselect five points.

Deselect or add to ten.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is precincts.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: But do the whole neighborhood.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I am.

We have to do it by.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yeah.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: By blocks so we go in here.

I'm going to Zoom in now and get the census blocks.

Assign this to ten.

And then get the area all up in here by census blocks.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes, please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We are still a long ways.

You need 10,000 people.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Can you go ahead and choose that south? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yeah, clear down to where it's District ten again.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay that area?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes. And the one below it as well.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I think I need to remove that.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I was wondering how precise these neighborhood boundaries are because it looks like it crosses a precinct or a block.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is a highway here. And I think this is just a median. And I may be wrong.

It's a median.

So all it does is make it look oddly shaped, more than anything.

You want to assign five points.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: And the one below can.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We have already done that.

This little guy here?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You are 2.23 percent low.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay can you Zoom out a little bit? And we need to be low a little bit to even out.

So I'm good with leaving it here unless somebody sees something else.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Looks pretty decent.

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Okay, I'm ready for the questions.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Good job Commissioner Orton I know it's not easy.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioner or ton why did this District take the shape it did and include the areas within it?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Kent after you are able to save would you Zoom out a little bit so I can see the shapes it took eventually.

Well, I didn't want us to get boxed into a corner and so that was that southwest portion. And then we added for population in areas that we thought that Commissioners felt associated together.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: How did this District take COIs into account?

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Well, I haven't -- I don't remember a lot of COIs taking about these areas except Westland, Garden City and I think Inkster associate together. Anyone else?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: They do a lot of business together. Businesses.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: We talked about also south of 7-Mile and Livonia being associated with the Garden City and Westland.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Excellent thank you.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you Commissioner Orton.

The next Commissioner to map is Rothhorn, okay, Commissioner Rothhorn are you ready?

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: May I ask a question before he comes on.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Absolutely Commissioner Curry.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: What I'm hearing it's appropriate to split the neighborhood, okay, thank you.
Great.

And Kent, it would be useful for me after you assign that please to I'd like to try to see those bubbles and see if we can sort of.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Clark, please?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I just need to get a reference.

Rebecca indicated that, that one Detroit neighborhood was kept there because of that high American or Arab American population.

Is that the one that was just below Warren and Pearl streets? Off Southfield freeway?
Okay perfect, thanks.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Here's the precincts and this is, it would be 90 per cent non-Hispanic white alone.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Interesting and that jives because we have Native Americans marking white so if you would, Kent, just for me, the western edge of the District nine where 19 and 9 intersect, that southwest corner there, what I'd like to do is just try to get just numbers so to speak, the dots help me see what.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Down in here it does not appear to be like this precinct here which runs up there, it's 22% non-Hispanic white alone.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Right, okay, so I guess we just have to trust it.
Okay thank you.

So let's go further we are going to head east in District nine and we are we still need looks like about 82000.

Okay so let's as we go east let's make sure we are filling in the southern part.

So yep, Midwest so let's go I guess what I'm suggesting Kent is if you head furthest south to make sure that we don't neglect areas, yes, so Delray.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Down in here.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Correct we want to start.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Underneath District 19 Commissioner Rothorn?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Yes.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Kent, can we Zoom out, please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: And Commissioner Curry I know this is your neighborhood.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Delray is not my neighborhood but it's really not that many people in Delray at all.
There is no one there hardly.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Spring well.
Help me know does Oakwood Heights, Carbon Works, Delray Spring Wells in this District as a Western District.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yeah, they would go together, yes.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Okay, thank you.

Let's do that, Kent, please.

And then just head east.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Is that what you had in mind?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: It is, thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Kent, these letters on these on the map that you're showing us it's driving me crazy.

I can't hardly see it.

It's making me have a headache because they are so light.

They are so light I can't hardly read them.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I understand, that is the way the application is set right now.

It does a white outline of the letters.

I was playing with it for a couple hours this morning and could not get rid of it.

I just wanted plain text.

We can see what we can do in the next 24 hours.

I'm sorry.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Thank you for trying, Kent.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: Yes, thank you.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: And what I'd like to do here at this point, Kent, is let's see District 13 is still over but it's better.

We are within range we are about 3% over.

So I like District 13 where it's at in general.

So what I'd like to do is, yeah, continue heading east with District 9.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Along this line?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Yes, please.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Rothorn I don't know if it will be too much, I was going to say you could extend it to Hamtramck but I don't know if that is your thought.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Yeah, this is where it gets tricky.

So I do want to try to honor that you know a Senate District that might allow Highland Park, excuse me, Hamtramck and heading north towards the, yeah, Warren, Sterling Heights area so I'm going to try that.

What that means is but I do want to honor Woodward also as sort of a divider where we don't break up the neighborhoods, so what I think you just did there, Kent, I'm not sure.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Where we are at is 1.84 under.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: When I say Woodward do you know which part I'm talking about when I say Woodward?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: No.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I'm not quite sure either, but it bisects Highland Park.

So we have taken off, so North Campau and I want to take those out.

I only want Highland Park.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: And Piety Hill is a divider.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I don't want to have you out here like that Campau, Bangla Town.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Campau is Bangla Town.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Is this one neighborhood?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: No it shouldn't be.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is what we have.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: It's two political Highland Park and Hamtramck are their own political entities within the broader City of Detroit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: And in that vein these are two precincts.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: We want to remove from Section 9 or District 9. Thank you.

And I do see, yep, so yes, your cursor is along that and take Piety Hill but not north end. Do you see the name I'm referring to? You got it, Kent, your cursor was closer.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I see it so you want Piety Hill.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Thanks Kent so we will try Piety Hill.

Yes, we will add Piety Hill and looking at the percentage of minority we are at 94%.

And I'm not happy with that.

And I'm not sure what to do.

So I'm just sort of acknowledging putting it on public record that this is it's your yeah looks like we got to do something different and to respect sort of public, yeah, the way that Detroit making sense of its 2.5 Senate districts trying to keep it together as much as possible this feels like I'm going to draw this until we get you know voting rights counsel or something else that feels like a better way to draw it.

So at this point, Kent, yeah, let's Zoom in again, sorry.

We are going to try to keep neighborhoods whole and respect that and we are still at the precinct level at this point, yes.

And we are just, yep, we are heading south to midtown.

South and I guess it's southeast, right, you got it.

And we will clean it up at down into core City, Wayne state.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Rothorn you don't need a disclaimer keep going.

Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: So I would say the further -- I really like what you did so far by the way but I would say I would kind of caution against going further south.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

I think once you get into the new center, Woodbridge area, those are you know places that are much more associated with the Wayne state University and the medical center and midtown as a whole.

Which I would say associates more with downtown than where this District starts.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: So what I'm hearing you say since we are about 4,000 under, maybe but so, yeah, so can you -- let's try the undo button, Kent, and just see what happens there.

Because what I'm thinking about is keeping Corktown, North Corktown, in that area because I do recognize there was a community of interest that was 482917, 48217 proposal that was given to us and, yeah.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I'm going to jump in I see Commissioner Clark and sometimes I steal my turn or I will never be able to have input so I apologize.

But I hear what Commissioner Eid is saying.

I just wouldn't know where else to put that where it would make sense because I know though it is identified as midtown, that area is still largely responsive to both the east and west sides of Detroit in terms of like services even the hospital center being there. So I don't know.

Those are my two cents I will be fine with you extending it all the way down.

Because I can't see it reasonably going somewhere else. Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I want to comment on what Anthony said. The medical center you're talking about is where the VA hospital is.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: They use people from Wayne state.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Uh-huh.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Wayne state medical so I see the two even though they are on other sides of Woodward I see the two being associated.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Yes, my grandmother swears by the hospital so that is the only place she goes all the way from 8 mile and Woodward that is where we take her in the ambulance.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I can see where it's used on the east side the hospital but I think it's associated with Wayne state a lot.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I'm happy to try to entertain that.

Leaving it out of the west side District if you will.

And so Kent what thank you for that undo and I think we are what -- let's start at the southern portion of this District 9.

So Corktown so west so we are not going to take into downtown where it says downtown Detroit and I'm looking for guidance here because I think that is right it's either the western or the eastern side.

And I think what Anthony was suggesting and right I got other Commissioners to sort of sounds like they were corroborating it we could associate downtown Detroit, midtown,

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: What is the population.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: What is the population of Elijah McCoy.

That will be hard to get.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: We are getting it right now.

That area right there is 350 people.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I'm tempted to assign the whole neighborhood and the one north the park community I can't quite read it.

So keep new center.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Virginia park community.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Yes, Virginia park community and Elijah McCoy I'm tempted to keep that into 9 and frankly Piety Hill I want Piety Hill also on the western side.

But then new center commons on the western side meaning District 9 and then new center commons, new center tech town, Wayne state and midtown, assign that to District 8, please.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You want all this area here in.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: What you just selected as nine, please.

And then the remainder of Piety Hill and Britini, sorry.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: No, I was just I think affirming that decision just thinking about like when we meet in Cadillac place for example, of course grand Boulevard everything behind even though you are passing new center as you are traveling back behind us is the area that you've just drawn whereas if you are going, you know, northbound Woodward that is when you get to new center so yeah that would make sense and are different communities.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Home away from home in Detroit is Piety Hill. I bike in there.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: You can go across to new center so yeah.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Just trying to cleanup some of these little pieces that will be left over.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Thank you appreciate that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: It's going to be like this all over the City.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I recognize and what I'm hoping to do Kent is just ask you sort of delegate you to clean up the dis-contiguities after this but fill in Piety Hill.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: The thing about it some of the areas what about Virginia park?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Let's add Virginia park.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: To District.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: To the Western District to the 9th.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Yes.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Now this neighborhood splits census blocks.
So do you want basically one side of the neighborhood is over there.
Do you want.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: What do I want.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: New center commons over or over here?

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: We will leave it here until we get public comment
and help us decide and now it seems in a good District.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Gate way is split.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Gate way neighborhood.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Neighborhood.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: So let's add gate way and fill in gate way to the
9th please and then we will call it good.
The 9th District good.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Rothorn be thinking of the answers to your
three questions.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This neighborhood line splits census blocks.
It probably goes up an alleyway.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: So let's leave it where it is, Kent. So I think we
are about 7,000 over, almost 8,000, which is about 3% over.

And that will allow us to get Hamtramck. I'm trying to answer the question.

Oh, I see a hand.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: The only thing I would look at is maybe taking Woodbridge
out of it and assigning it with you know whatever comes next if we are over.
Because I think it's still in 9.

To me it's not this area isn't really about east side or west side because I think generally
there is a sense that okay you have an east side of Woodward and an east side of
Woodward.

It's a common joke that is passed around Detroit all the time.

Are you east side or are you west side.

But this community to me you know we are getting into the University and the you know
the financial districts and the medical districts.

And that part of it really does serve both sides.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Which one is Woodbridge? I see it there.

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Upper left, you have it next to eight right now.
I would not want to split it up.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Does it say Jeffreys? Should Jeffreys so
Woodbridge and Jeffreys which is a smaller one just to the east? And smushed
between the west bridge and midtown, that Jeffreys neighborhood, should that also be
in eight? That was a thumbs up right?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: There may be more up through here I'm not sure, pretty close.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Is it okay on public record to say please check for dis-contiguities afterwards and we will move on to the next person? Is that good? Looks like it's legit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: These neighborhoods in here you see these neighborhoods are in 19 and split between 19 and 9.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I do and those are split with the understanding that there is a significant Arab minority in District 19 therefore it's appropriate to split the neighborhood.

Thank you.

Yeah, sorry, thank you for correcting me it's the northern region of 19.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Commissioner Rothorn, I know I stepped out for a minute for the rest room.

Okay.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: I did and the one thing I'm noticing now is District 13 I think palmer, that little corner north of Highland Park that o, no, that is after. Never mind, never mind.

I see it.

I just wanted to, yeah, the state fair.

And pen raise and pen rise.

Penrose, is that right? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is Penrose right there.

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: Those three neighborhoods are east of Woodward so I just wanted to recognize that that could be we could shave off some more of 13 there if we wanted to.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Okay, Commissioner Rothorn.
Our next Commissioner is Vice Chair Szetela.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: All right, so nine is 4,000 over right now, right? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Correct.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay, so can you Zoom in a little bit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: What area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: To the center and I want to look at Highland Park in particular.

A little back out.

Highland Park and Hamtramck.

I'm trying to see the lines for Hamtramck.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Hamtramck would be this area.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Right.

Can you volume in so that Hamtramck is central? And lift it up a little bit? .

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Want to go up ward?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Zoom out a little bit so I can see the areas around it, what are the dots we are seeing? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is non-Hispanic white.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Population.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Of the total pop of an area.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay, what happened to all our little dots? Where did they go? They were there a second ago can you Zoom in? That is better.

Okay so I'm just going to start there and pull down to the shoreline.

So I want you to select everything along there to the shoreline.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay, shall this be District eight I take it?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, because we already have little bits of eight down there so.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Just to help Kent out is he grabbing bell aisle too?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I want you to grab bell aisle and the airport sub too.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Kent, that is not what we said.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So if you could grab the airport sub now stop, back up a little bit, sorry.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You want all this area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I don't want you to grab past the diagonal see where it says Gratiot leave that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I can do that.

So you want airport sub.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Airport sub, Gratiot Township, and then McDougall Hunt down. Elmwood Park down.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: All this area.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Including this area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Grab those and throw them in.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This is where we split gate way I'm going to go ahead and assign at the block level.

It's a little tedious but it gets it done.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You can take Lafayette park too.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: So this is going to stay in eight?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: That whole area everything unassigned Lafayette park. Yep.

Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, what is the logic here you're following not going below that one line? Going further south sed Szetela you will see as I finish.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, but you accidentally grabbed part of Highland Park so can you put that back to nine? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Yes, I did, didn't I.
Don't want to do that.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: And just continue to follow that diagonal like you are doing.

And then, yep, whatever that little guy that is sitting there missing, Franklin.

All right, so now let's look to our northern boundary.

And we are going to start going up into Warren.

Yep.

So I would just start with the southern part of Warren up to the top of centerline and cut across and see where we are at for population.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I was going to turn the label on that is 140,000 so you can get most of Warren or go across here.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Weiss?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Then Commissioner Orton?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: I just noticed and I don't know if you noticed but he has nine tied up.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Isn't that nice.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Thank you.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: That was Commissioner Orton.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Eagle eye Orton.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: The catcher.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So everybody knows what I'm thinking my thought process is I'm trying to pull the Bangladeshi community and Warren in with Hamtramck that is the whole point of this District we are pulling down to the shoreline then we are going to go up and try to bring in the rest of the Bangladeshi community.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: How far up do we want to go? Sed Szetela go to the top line of centerline see how centerline is sitting there go up to there and see where we are at population wise.

It may put us over and we will see where we are at because we can take off.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That right there is 68,000.
So that will take you 10,000 over.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay so take out centerline and I think it's got one more little divot down.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That puts in 56,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: I'm over.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Now you will be like a thousand under.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yeah, go ahead and do that.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Now you are well, no, evidently, I looked at it wrong that is 19,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Scroll back in a little bit.

So I want to rebalance this a little bit so I want to go west of centerline and go up. But I want to take off those Townships that are all the way on the east right now. So.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Those?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So, right, my east see where we have centerline and come up and go, yep, that those two corners right there take those off. Is that part of east point you said?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: I was saying you're talking about the area that is close to east point and I was shaking my head like yeah take that.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Now I want you to go on the other side of centerline and we are going to go north of there.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yep.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That will add in 17,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: And how far are we under with that, 25?

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 5360, 2.02%.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So we are 5,000 under.

What were those the areas on the other side?

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Corners to take off sed Szetela yeah just curious.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 8500.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Centerline will give us too much.

So can you grab centerline and we will take off a couple districts on the eastern border. No, no, keep what you had.

So add centerline.

So now we are going to go over.

And now I want you to go to the right of what you just added, yep.

And I want you to start chipping away.

So take that upper Township or upper precinct.

I'd rather you start north and kind of come down around centerline but that will work too. Why don't we...we are supposed to take a break at 2:30 anyway. So why don't we just stop for a second.

If you want to do that or we can.

>> CHAIR KELLUM: Are you sure? I was going to let you.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: How much am I off? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 3192 high.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So I want you to take off that one little cube that is 1163 and then we are just going to stop.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 28,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay so I want you to add in Madison heights.

Add in Madison heights.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: To eight.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Yes.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Okay.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: We are just going to take the first strip of Warren up to 14 mile road so just that little yep right along Madison heights just a little bit, not the whole area across just a little bit.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: This area.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Not the whole area just the first strip.

The first precincts there.

That is still too weighed I want the eastern border right along Madison heights.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: These?

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: That's right sorry if I was not more clear.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: I was just looking at it different.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So now we are 30,000 over.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 38,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Now we will go back to the eastern edge I had drawn near centerline and we are going to take off those yep take off over there and then see what the population is.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 8,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay keep going.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 14,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay keep going.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 21,000.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Add in centerline.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 29 or 30,000.

That's 30,164.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Okay remove those.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Well, I did it just wrong.

Shows District 8 as being 11,000 over.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Continuing taking away those precincts under centerline, just keep going over until we get to where we need to be.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Harper Woods, Grosse Pointe village of gross, Grosse Pointe, Grosse Pointe.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Yeah, there is five of them but I don't want to take away from eight at all.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: None of those are in eight.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Okay then that is fine.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Harper Woods is not part of the point though. You have Grosse Pointe Woods and shores and park and Grosse Pointes what is the other one?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: We heard Harper Woods was part of the points that they considered themselves a community of interest with the points.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: You are including I'm saying it's not a Grosse Pointe that's all.

I thought.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: I get that part. We will have to include the east side of Detroit how does that feel for you Juanita? I know nothing about the east side of Detroit.

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: And I'm in the same bag as you. I know where Harper Woods is.

And Grosse Pointes somewhat but I'm not too familiar with the other points.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: So we did have a discussion about this with Commissioner Kellom.

She had mentioned we pulled up the neighborhood maps and so you have east English village and Sherwood forest is in there and she had indicated while she was in the room that she thought those communities yep there we go do affiliate morning side cornerstone village they all associate with the Grosse Pointes.

And you know there is pros and cons on that.

You know one way or another like Harper Woods but it would not be unnatural to put them with the Grosse Pointes.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Then let's go ahead and do that, please.

>> VICE CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Eid?

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I agree it would not be unnatural but wondering if maybe we can get a little bit more creative about it.

I like what Commissioner Rothhorn had said earlier about trying to turn this into two different districts one with the Grosse Pointes and that moves up to St. Clair shores and another with this more industrial area on the east side of Detroit.

That is being painted right now.

So that's just my idea.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

92.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: I think I like this better.

Just for that reason.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Commissioner Clark has his hand for you Commissioner Wagner?

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Go ahead Commissioner Clark.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I personally don't see where east point is associated with St. Clair shores that much or Grosse Pointe area that much.

And that's why I suggested to take a look at the remaining shoreline up on the northern end of the District that is drawn and not include east point.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: I would agree with you.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I'm talking about going up towards new Baltimore and then over into that one peninsula that we haven't covered.

The significance of the peninsula, there is bridges over there that they have a lot of problems with because of the lake.

They have water level problems, which is the same things you see down at St. Clair shores.

High water levels.

And so they have the same environmental concerns.

That is why I would suggest that but, Anthony, do you have any comments on that?

>> CHAIR KELLOM: I actually had a comment.

Commissioner Eid might be chewing on a snack so I'm going to jump in.

Commissioner Clark, so I agree with your synopsis of the northern lakeshore area.

However, there is some commonality with east point.

For instance you can drive east down 8 mile and go all the way to Lake Shore Drive.

And which runs into either side remember 8 mile being the dividing line between Detroit, Roseville so I don't know if that orange line is 8 mile, I'm not sure.

But there is some commingling there even with schools in that area.

So but it's up to Commissioner Wagner.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 9 mile right here.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Okay.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: That is 10-Mile.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: And 8 mile is lower.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 8 mile is the locality boundary, pretty close to it.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: That's what I said, Kent.

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Incompetent within the way it is.

I like the numbers on the other one better.

Because we got closer.

However, the demographics were not where they needed to be.

So I'm going to hold here on this one then.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Michigan Department of State did you have any questions for Commissioner Wagner?

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: No I think I've got everything.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you so much Commissioner Wagner.

Our next Commissioner is -- you're welcome -- our next Commissioner is Commissioner Weiss.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Thank you, Madam Chair.

Obviously, I don't know much about the area.

But Sterling Heights and Warren I remember from the Bangladeshis.

I would be inclined to run north but since I have the colored pencils and I will give you all the erasers I would like to start down and finish Warren, the rest of that.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: Next?

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Let's go with east point and Macomb and see what our totals will be. I'd like to take the rest of Sterling Heights and see what the total is there. All right I wish you would add that, please.

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: You need 14,000 more people to be ideal.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: What is in Frazier? .

>> MR. KENT STIGALL: 14,726.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: I think that is pretty close.

That was pretty easy.

I'll do this again if you like.

I'll pass on another turn.

I will stay with that and looks good and covers Bangladesh and they are a very nice group of people and wanted themselves in a District if possible.

They did want Hamtramck but obviously that is a little hard to do I believe but I think we did pretty good here.

So I'm satisfied by that.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: Thank you Commissioner Weiss you did so well there are no questions for you to answer.

You got a thumbs up from MDOS.

>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: That's good I like that.

>> CHAIR KELLOM: So put down your pencils and your erasers, next we have Commissioner Witjes.

>> COMMISSIONER WITJES: Okay I'm going to try my best here.

So I guess we will take the reminder of Clinton and Macomb county there.

We will add Macomb Township.

Just those three Townships and make it into a T for now and Shelby and Chesterfield and new Baltimore.

SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: If I can make a quick point if I could Commissioner Kellom.

With the changes that you've done look at the population now for District 7.

The white population and the non-Hispanic Black population, that has significantly changed.

So I'm not suggesting keeping this or not keeping it.

But I think that this is a great example where you can see sometimes small changes have significant population impacts as they implicate the Voting Rights Act.

So this is just an example.

I was just watching the numbers as you assigned, deassigned the parts of the District. And it changes very I think informative to show what these changes can do to reshape the population.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Thank you, Bruce.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Thank you, you know, one of the things we could consider is to take that eastern part of Detroit and moving it into number 6 District and then putting the lakeshore back to how it was originally yesterday.

We have gotten a lot of comments about the lakeshore.

And one of our objectives as we listened to people was to have the lakeshore represented appropriately.

And we did that I think on the west side.

I think we have done that.

But and moving the Detroit part up into District six and I know there are too many people there and we will have to reconfigure things.

I think you get a better mix of racial population.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: So what are you suggesting specifically? You can be straightforward.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I really had not.

>> MR. MORGAN: It sound like you are suggesting Detroit here this portion going into six and making changes.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: And Warren as well and industrialized.

I think the new Chrysler plant is down in eastern part of Detroit too.

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: I was trying to grab population from the west but I have to take some from somewhere first.

So that's what I'm trying to get a consensus from you all how that needs to happen. We don't have to talk around it.

Let's actually look at the cities and the places and the numbers and speak directly to what the change needs to be.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: You can still take some from the west on eight particularly in the triangle area just south of 8 mile.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Whereas these two here if you were to balance those out then you could focus more on 8 and then make changes later.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: 16 we need 52 and what is the other one 5 you're talking about?

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah, just a moment.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: 6 and 7 we feel pretty good about and all the others we have not perfected in the Detroit area and 5 is just sort of further away from Detroit. It's parts of it but it's not quite a Detroit one yet.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: You're not talking what I'm talking.

>> MR. MORGAN: What you are talking about here is 2 and 16.

16 is 52000 over.

And 2 is 52000 under.

And then I think what Commissioner Clark was saying you can bring 2 down into 5 and 5 into 16 or something like that if you didn't want to take Oakland Township.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Well let's try that.

>> MR. MORGAN: So Shelby Township out of 5 is the first?

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Yep.

We will put that in 16, Doug?

>> MR. MORGAN: I thought you said in 2, the balance of Shelby into 2.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: 2 that would be my recommendation.

>> MR. MORGAN: Then you also have the village of Utica.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I would include that in 2 because the majority of that is above M59.

Which is a major highway going through there.

>> MR. MORGAN: That gets you 13,000 under in 2.

And then you've got Oakland, you've got Macomb.

You have other areas if you like 25 and 7 the way they are, then you're looking at 5, 16 and then I don't know if we haven't really talked about anything over here in 18.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: What is 16 is still over? Or do we need.

>> MR. MORGAN: Yeah, we have not taken anything out of 16.

What we did is take a little out of 5 so 5 is under and contemplating having 5 go into this portion of Sterling Heights potentially.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I would try to balance that and then if you need some more Steve I would take the northern part of Oakland Township se Szetela Commissioner Reinhardt? I'm promoting you, Sarah Reinhardt.

>> MS. SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you Madam Chairperson.

I just wanted to indicate that per the law the justification log reflecting back on District 16 which was drawn by Commissioner Clark.

One of the justifications provided was keeping together the COI of the Asian population in Sterling Heights and Troy.

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

Thank you.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: When we did that, we just took the two western most rows of Townships over in Sterling Heights.

We didn't take all of Sterling Heights at that point in time.

Because and the reason for that was in Troy the eastern part of Troy down at 16 mile and south has got a lot of the Asian population.

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Maybe you want to have the theme or the dots for the Asian population?

>> VICE CHAIR ROTHORN: Sounds like northern Oakland is a pretty good, safe bet.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I would give the northern part of Oakland Township a try and see where we are at population wise.

>> MR. MORGAN: Looking at Oakland Township all of it is 20 which is more than you need so you're contemplating taking the northern most portion of Oakland first and going down?

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I'd only take the northern part, I would not go down after that.

>> MR. MORGAN: You probably won't have enough population.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: Probably won't then I think you have to go to Sterling Heights and move some of that to 5.

>> MR. MORGAN: You have Macomb if you are looking at that.
With Macomb being a larger Township, depending what you want to do either two into Sterling Heights or 5 into Sterling Heights.

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Take the top part of.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Can we put the dots on for the Asian population for Sterling Heights, John? Because that will be helpful to look at Sterling Heights.

So basically, we want the indicators of Asian population is what we are looking for.

>> CHAIR SZETELA: I believe it's pop AS is Asian.
Pop NA is Native American.

>> MR. MORGAN: You are correct.

>> MR. MORGAN: Okay for an indicator we have one of the Asian variables and then total population.

And this is at the Township level.

And then I will have to undo this because it's going to assign the whole Township.

So at this point District 16 with 52000 surplus population is 15% non-Hispanic Asian and voting age is 14%.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: John, can you also put up the election results for 16, please?

>> CHAIR SZETELA: Commissioner Clark?

DISCLAIMER: This is NOT a certified or verbatim transcript, but rather represents only the context of the class or meeting, subject to the inherent limitations of realtime captioning. The primary focus of realtime captioning is general communication access and as such this document is not suitable, acceptable, nor is it intended for use in any type of legal proceeding.

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Sterling Heights south of Utica you see a lot of blank spaces.

Yeah, further down that big one.

That I believe is the GM tech center down in that area.

So that is where Van Dyke and mound are.

>> MR. MORGAN: Smaller dot is 3% whereas this larger dot over here is 30, 35, so this is the portion you were contemplating taking out.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: That was my suggestion and the western side is kind of Linked-In with the eastern side of Troy.

So.

>> MR. MORGAN: You wouldn't get to that like you said that is associated with that.

COMMISSIONER CLARK: I tonight think it's beneficial to take out.

>> MR. MORGAN: Looking at 16 at this point it's 49% Biden.

51 for Trump or 50/50 it's right in the middle.

Clinton 46.

Trump 54.

Obama 46.

Romney 53.

And 2020 U.S. Senate is Peters 48.5.

James 51.5 and Stabenow is 50.5.

James is 49.5.

Peters in 14 is 50.4.

Land is 49.5.

Stabenow is 53.

Hoekstra is 47.

Whitmer 51.

Schuetz 49.

48.5.

For Governor 14 shower 35.

Snyder 64.

For Attorney General 48 for Nessel, 52 for Leonard.

Totten, 38, Schuetz, 62.

Secretary of State Benson 52.

Lange 48.

Dillard 32.

Johnson 67.

>> MR. BRUCE ADELSON: The election results in the system per District or can you get down to the either the Township level or a smaller level or if you just clicked on a square with a particular dot, would that show a unique election result? Or are they all just District wide?